ON HOLOCAUST COOKBOOKS: FOURTH GENERATION JEWS AND THE RE-CREATION OF JEWISH FOOD CULTURE

By

Talya Peri Slaw

Submitted to the graduate degree program in Communication Studies and the Graduate Faculty of the University of Kansas in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

_____

Chairperson Jay Childers

_____

Dr. Dave Tell

_____

Dr. Brett Bricker

Date Defended: January 30th, 2018

The Thesis Committee for Talya Peri Slaw

certifies that this is the approved version of the following thesis:

ON HOLOCAUST COOKBOOKS: FOURTH GENERATION JEWS AND THE RE-CREATION OF JEWISH FOOD CULTURE

_____

Chairperson Jay Childers

Date approved: January 30th, 2018

ABSTRACT

Food is essential: to memory, to culture, and to identity. In the introduction to *In Memory's Kitchen,* Cara De Silva (1996) argues, "Our personal gastronomic traditions – what we eat, the foods and foodways we associate with the rituals of childhood, marriage, and parenthood, moments around the table, celebrations – are critical components of our identities" (p. xxiv). Food, as it is often associated with specific periods of time, events, and feelings, is undoubtedly intertwined with memory. This is especially true for Jews.

In Judaism, not only is nearly every holiday associated in some way with special foods (such as the Passover Seder or eating fried potato latkes on Hanukkah), but the Jewish deli also played, at times, a more important role in American Jewish social life than the synagogue.

Despite this rich tradition of associating food with remembrance and everyday life, food talk is often missing from discussions of the Holocaust. And yet, it was food talk that gave many in the labor, concentration, and death camps the will to survive and hope that they would one-day return to the life they had lived before the camps. Three extant, published cookbooks describe the way food was used for survival during (*In Memory's Kitchen,* written in a concentration camp) and after (*Recipes Remembered* and *the Holocaust Survivors Cookbook,* two collections of recipes from survivors) the Holocaust.

This thesis will explore just that, as I examine the relationship between food or "food talk" and memory. This is not just an important question for Holocaust memory, but also for public memory scholars and rhetoricians writ large. Rhetoricians have recently begun to take an interest in understanding food from a variety of perspectives. However, the relationship between food, collective memory, and identity has been left under-theorized. In this thesis, I bridge that gap, arguing that these cookbooks can make the past present and thus help to reestablish a lost Jewish identity for fourth generation Jews.

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis has become a reality with the help of many individuals. Foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. Jay Childers. Without Dr. Childers' enormous patience and steadfast encouragement, this thesis would not exist. His guidance, criticism, and revisions were essential in completing this thesis.

Second, I would like to thank Dr. Brett Bricker for always keeping his office door open and challenging me to think beyond assumptions I had taken for granted. Third, I would like to thank Dr. Dave Tell, whose classes and feedback have been instrumental in developing this thesis. Fourth, I would like to thank Dr. Robert Rowland. The beginning steps of this thesis began in a seminar paper for his class. Dr. Rowland's initial feedback helped me to develop important ideas that are still prominent in this thesis.

Finally, I would like to thank my mother and grandmother for being my first (and most important) role models of proud Jewish women and for teaching me how to cook our family recipes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter One – Introduction

Food is essential – to memory, to culture, and to identity. In the introduction to *In Memory's Kitchen*, Cara De Silva (1996) argues, "Food is who we are in the deepest sense, and not because it is transformed into blood and bone. Our personal gastronomic traditions – what we eat, the foods and foodways we associate with the rituals of childhood, marriage, and parenthood, moments around the table, celebrations – are critical components of our identities" (p. xxiv). Food is often associated with specific periods of time, events, and feelings, and it is thus undoubtedly intertwined with memory. This is especially true for Jews.

In Judaism, not only is nearly every holiday associated in some way with special foods (such as the Passover Seder, dipping apples in honey on Rosh Hashanah, eating cheesecake on Shavuot or eating fried potato latkes and doughnuts on Hanukkah), but every life event, including britot, bas mitzvahs, weddings, and even shivas, is associated with a large meal. Many of these foods also serve a memory function: the foods on the Seder plate are meant to evoke memories of slavery in Egypt, the fried foods on Hanukkah are meant to remind Jews of the oil lasting a full eight days, etc. Beyond religious functions, food plays an important role in American Jewish social life as well. It was the deli, not the synagogue, after all, which "served as . . . a place for the reinforcement of American Jewish identity" (Merwin, 2015, p. xiii).

Despite this rich tradition of associating food with remembrance and everyday life, food talk is often missing from discussions of the Holocaust. Perhaps this absence is explained by pain: pain of the tremendous loss Jews experienced during and after the Holocaust – loss not just in terms of people, but also culture. In addition to its role in the spiritual and religious aspects of their lives, Eastern Europe had been the center of Jewish culture. And yet, it was food talk that gave many in the labor, concentration, and death camps the will to survive and hope that they

would one day return to the life they had lived before the camps. *In Memory's Kitchen*, a publication of one of the longest and most complete cookbooks written *in* a concentration camp, describes food talk as essential to survival. Together with two other cookbooks of recipes collected from Holocaust survivors, these cookbooks tell us not just about food talk being used to survive in the camps but also Jewish life after the Holocaust. This thesis will explore just that, as I examine the relationship between food, or "food talk," and memory, attempting to understand why so many turned to food as a way of coping with life in the camps and why many continue to remember life before the Holocaust in terms of food. What might be learned about not just ways in which Holocaust memory can be further developed, but also how Jewish identity may be reinvigorated for fourth generation Jews[1]? More specifically, how do these cookbooks attempt to use narratives alongside recipes to reinvigorate Holocaust memory and Jewish identity for fourth generation Jews?

Three published "Holocaust cookbooks" exist to date. Though these cookbooks have many differences, they collectively represent the only complete, extant "Holocaust cookbooks." I refer to them as Holocaust cookbooks not because they were all written in or designed for use during the Holocaust, but because they have a relationship to the Holocaust and/or survivors of the Holocaust. In *In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy From the Women of Terezin*, Cara De Silva presents Mina's cookbook, a collection of recipes written by women in Terezin (or Theresienstadt in German, a concentration camp in then Czechoslovakia). These recipes, of all three cookbooks, were written the earliest, as they were written during the Holocaust, from inside a concentration camp. By comparison, the other two cookbooks, *The Holocaust Survivor's*

[1] What is a fourth generation Jew? Second generation Jews are Jews that are the children of survivors of the Holocaust. Third generation Jews are the grandchildren of survivors, and fourth generation Jews are their great-grandchildren. Most fourth generation Jews are millennials and will be the first generation that will witness the death of all Holocaust survivors by natural causes.

Cookbook and *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival*, are collections of recipes from survivors and their families. The recipes in each of these were written down for cookbook use long after the Holocaust, but most were learned, made, and eaten by survivors long before the Holocaust began.

Therefore, these three cookbooks should be viewed as existing on a continuum of distance from the Holocaust. *In Memory's Kitchen*, since it was written the earliest, with the only recipes written down during the Holocaust, occupies one end of this continuum and symbolically represents survival during the Holocaust and recollection of a pre-Holocaust Jewish world by those that actually lived in it. *The Holocaust Survivors Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* both represent survival beyond the Holocaust. The former sits in the middle of the continuum. In this cookbook, the editor presents the collected recipes unedited, just as they were sent in, so a recipe might be missing a step or details about preparation. In contrast, the other edited volume – *Recipes Remembered* –which sits at the opposite end of the continuum, is meant to be used with ease by anyone who happens to pick up the cookbook. Its recipes are edited and tested, as any other modern cookbook is. Sometimes the recipes are not even exactly from survivors; rather, they are replications of recipes remembered, but not learned, from survivors. Thus, this cookbook represents not just survival but also the bringing of the past into the present, of recalling Jewish life before the Holocaust by those who never lived it, effectively establishing a secular Jewish identity for the fourth generation of survivors.

In this thesis, I offer a rhetorical reading of these cookbooks, arguing that these cookbooks may fill the gaps in the functions of Holocaust memory, where memoirs alone may fail. While memoirs recall the past on paper, the recipes offered in cookbooks bring the past into

the present. This is especially important for younger Jews, given the importance of food culture within Jewish life and potential threats to Jewish identity in an increasingly secular world.

In this thesis, I argue that the cookbooks reinvigorate not only Holocaust memory, but also Jewish identity and culture for fourth generation American Jews. This thesis will proceed in three chapters. First, in Chapter Two, I argue that the cookbooks offer a way of re-framing Holocaust memory. Instead of focusing on loss and melancholy, the cookbooks present a narrative of survival and encourage younger Jews to take pride in their survival. Second, in Chapter Three, I argue that given the strong relationship between Judaism/Jewish-ness and food culture, these cookbooks can offer fourth generation Jews a new means of forming a Jewish identity in an increasingly secular world by making the present past and recreating a pre-Holocaust Jewish world in the modern day. Finally, in Chapter Four, I will offer some implications and further directions for this project.

The introduction will begin by explaining the justification for this study. Then, I will turn to a deeper description of each cookbook before explaining the methodology I use to examine and analyze the cookbooks. Finally, I outline the organizational scheme of this thesis.

Justification for Study

Scholars have long recognized that food and eating are not "purely biological" activities for humans. Anthropologists, sociologists, historians, and many other disciplines have acknowledged the importance of food in human culture and society. Academics have long considered food to be beyond biology; rather, food is invested with "social meaning(s)" (Bardenstein, 2002, p. 355). However, few scholars have given explicit attention to the relationship between food and collective memory. Jon D. Holtzman (2006) argues that this attention to food is "bound up" in discussion of memory without ever explicitly framing "their

focus as food and memory" (Holtzman, p. 362). A notable exception to this is David Sutton's *Remembrance of Repasts*, which begins to develop a theoretical framework for understanding the interrelationship of memory, food, and culture. However, Sutton still faced negative feedback from his colleagues when he began working on this book. In his introduction, Sutton describes the confusion from his colleagues when he first began presenting his work on food and memory that would later become *Remembrance of Repasts*. For them, food was not a source of scholarly discussion. Sutton describes this as odd and confusing, especially after spending so much time with the Kalyminians (the Greek islanders whose food memory Sutton presented in his book), who understood food as a critical part of memory and culture.

It was around this time—the 1990s—that Sutton began explicitly tying food to memory in anthropology that others began to treat food as a more explicit source for scholarly research. For instance, a 1999 *Chronicle of Higher Education* article, "A place at the Table," describes food studies as an emerging field while simultaneously prompting a discussion as to whether this was a "legitimate academic pursuit" or merely "scholarship-lite" (Sutton, 2001, p. 3). Sutton argues that it is precisely the "obviousness and taken-for-grantedness" of food that makes it a legitimate area for research (Sutton, 2001, p. 3). Food is packed with meaning and structure. Food, as many scholars have since told us since this time, is ripe for scholarship about economics, consumerism, social class, politics, and identity.[2]

---

[2] See Sutton's Introduction in *Remembrance of Repasts*, Levenstein, Harvey A. *Paradox of plenty: a social history of eating in modern America*. New York: Oxford U Press, 1994. Print.; Levenstein, Harvey A. *Revolution at the table: the transformation of the American diet*. New York: Oxford U Press, 1988. Print.; McMillan, Tracie. *The American way of eating: undercover at Walmart, Applebee's, farm fields, and the dinner table*. New York: Scribner, 2012. Print.; Nestle, Marion. *Food politics: how the food industry influences nutrition and health*. Berkeley: U of California Press, 2002. Print.; Pringle, Peter. *Food, inc.: Mendel to Monsanto--the promises and perils of the biotech harvest*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2003. Print.; Inness, Sherrie A. *Kitchen culture in America: popular representations of food, gender, and race*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania Press, 2001. Print.; Patel, Raj. *Stuffed and starved: the hidden battle for the world food system*. Brooklyn, NY: Melville House Pub., 2009. Print.

Food is also ripe for rhetorical investigation. A 2015 forum in *Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies* is demonstrative. In the introduction to the forum, Anna Young, Justin Eckstein, and Donovan Conley argue, "How we eat—the origin and handling of ingredients; the modes of production and distribution involved; the social contexts of consumption; and the invention and processing applied to the end product—is rhetorical" (Young, Eckstein, & Conley, 2015, p. 198). The articles in this forum analyze many aspects of the rhetorical nature of food and foodways – the role of gender in cooking (both at home and in restaurants), celebrity chefs, the relationship between the dual problems of hunger and obesity, "authenticity" in food, access to food and foodways, and the ways in which the circulation of food results in appropriation (such as Britain adopting Chicken Tikka Masala as its national dish). What is absent from this forum, however, is attention to the relationship between food and memory.

There are some rhetoricians who have drawn attention to this intersection. *Food in the USA*, an edited volume, deals with the intersections of food, memory, and identity in the U.S. in a host of different contexts and cultures. *Food as Communication, Communication as Food*, another edited volume, explicitly ties food to the construction of social identity, creation/communication of social and cultural values, and collective memory. Food, though not a narrative in and of itself, unlocks functions not met by more traditional forms of narratives. Perhaps most powerfully, food allows us to construct embodied memories that are absent from memoirs alone. Recall the power of food discussed earlier: food is symbolic, creating powerful memories and often acting "as a locus for historically constructed identity" (Holtzman, 2006, p. 364). Dan Merwin argues that this was especially true for American Jews after the Holocaust: "like much of American Jewish culture, Jewish food was a hybrid – a mishmash of old-world cooking and customs, Jewish dietary laws, and an ongoing accommodation with American life"

(Merwin, quoting Ira Wolfman, 2015, p. 11). As Jewish identity changed after the Holocaust, so too did Jewish food. Merwin describes the pastrami sandwich – an icon of the American Jewish deli – as a palimpsest: "a blank screen onto which succeeding generations of Jews projected different images of themselves and their group as they became progressively more acculturated into American society" (Merwin, 2015, p. 12).

Sutton (2011) argues that it is this embodied-ness of food that renders it a particularly intense and compelling medium for memory. This explains why a few scholars have begun to turn their attention to cookbooks as an important site for subversion, for the creation of countercultural memory[3] and also as an identity creation function, in this case re-creating a shared Jewish community and identity.[4]

Cookbooks can function as memorial sites that offer specific iterations of history, tradition, and culture. *In Memory's Kitchen*, of the three cookbooks, is most obviously a memorial site. It is a glimpse not only into how those in the camps were able to survive but also a statement about what survivors expected to go back to after the war. Jewish food culture before the Holocaust can be understood through the recipes in *In Memory's Kitchen*. The other two cookbooks, by offering memoirs alongside recipes, also give us historical insight into Jewish life before the Holocaust. Cookbooks, Carole Bardenstein (2002) argues, are especially important for those who are exiled from their home, as the Jews were during World War II. As she writes, cookbooks are able to articulate the longing of the exiles "for the world from which they have

---

[3] For more, see: Eves, R.C. (2005). "A Recipe for Remembrance: Memory and Identity in African American Women's Cookbooks." *Rhetoric Review 24*,3. 280-97
Bower, A.L. (1997). "Bound Together: Recipes, Lives, Stories, and Readings." *Recipes for Reading: Community Cookbooks, Stories, Histories.* Amherst: U of Massachusetts Press. 1-14

[4] Fore more, see: Floyd, Janet, and Laurel Forster. (2003) *The recipe reader: narratives, contexts, traditions*. Aldershot, Hants, England: Ashgate.; Willan, Anne, Mark Cherniavsky, and Kyri Claflin. (2012). *The cookbook library: four centuries of the cooks, writers, and recipes that made the modern cookbook*. Berkeley: U of California Press

been absented due to circumstances beyond their control, of gathering together in a poignant attempt to commune with that world by partaking of a disconnected fragment of it" (Bardenstein, p. 353).

These cookbooks do not just tell us about the past; rather, they make present the past. By offering usable recipes and asking that survivors' stories be read aloud and discussed when serving the food, these cookbooks ask readers to reconstruct Jewish life, especially Jewish food culture, in a world beyond the Holocaust. In this sense, the Holocaust cookbooks offer a means for constructing collective memory. Maurice Halbwachs (1992) argues that collective memory is created within specific social frameworks that are created by particular needs and interests within a group. These frameworks are what control how narratives are shaped and remembered and what meaning the group gives to particular memories and narratives.

During the Holocaust, food talk, or "cooking with the mouth," offered those in the camps a means of finding the will to continue living, to hope for a future beyond the camps. Outside of the camps, and decades beyond the Holocaust, these cookbooks are created in the interest of never forgetting, of continuing a Jewish culture at risk of being lost. It is within this social framework that the recipes are presented. The cookbooks, recipes side-by-side with memoirs, offer a site of collective memory, where the Jewish world pre-Holocaust may not only be remembered but also reenacted through continuing to cook and share recipes.

Cookbooks then, unlike memoirs alone, have the ability to tap into an incredibly powerful form of body memory. While recipes alone can recall past food memories, the call to actually cook and share these recipes present in each of the cookbooks ensures that the past is brought into the present in a more literal sense. Rosalyn Collings Eves (2005), in her work on African-American women's cookbooks, takes this further, suggesting that cookbooks "function

rhetorically as memory texts: to memorialize both individuals and communities . . . and to generate a sense of collective memory that in turn shapes communal identity" (Eves, p. 281). This scholarship clearly offers a ripe source of theory that can be used to understand these cookbooks. I now turn to a fuller description of each of the cookbooks I plan to examine.

In Memory's Kitchen

In Memory's Kitchen is a Holocaust cookbook in the most literal sense, as it is a collection of recipes written down by women in Terezin. As a result, it requires the most context to be understood.

Theresienstadt (in German), or Terezin (in Czech), was unique among the Nazi's network of labor, concentration, and death camps. It was used as a transit camp to Auschwitz and as a camp for "prominents." Jews of particular merit (e.g. those who had provided service to Germany during World War I) or skill (such as a talented musicians or well-known scientists or scholars) were housed here. It was Terezin that the Nazis used as a "show camp," a model ghetto meant to demonstrate the decency with which the Third Reich treated the Jews.

In reality, Terezin was a Potemkin village, no less riddled with disease, fear, or death than the other camps. This is evidenced by terrifying statistics: As many as 53,004 Jews lived in a space that had housed 7,000 Czechs the year prior. In 1942, 15,891 died from starvation alone. In total, 144,000 Jews were sent to Terezin: 33,000 died there and 88,000 were later deported to Auschwitz. At the end of the war, only 19,000 of the 144,000 people sent to Terezin were alive. The statistics are even more startling for children: of the 15,000 children sent to Terezin, only 100 were alive by the end of the war (De Silva, 1996, p. ix – xvi).

And yet, with so many prominent Jews living under one roof, Terezin was unique among the camps in its attempt to maintain Jewish life. Terezin had a lending library with tens of

thousands of volumes; Rabbi Leo Baeck, a well-known German rabbi, offered classes in theology and philosophy; symphonic music was composed and performed in the camp; a lecture circuit was developed; artists painted in ghetto workshops overseen by Nazi supervisors; children were given the education of middle- or upper-class Jewish children (De Silva, 1996, p. ix – xvi).

It was in this context that the recipes found in *In Memory's Kitchen* were written. Using any scraps of paper they could get their hands on, women in Terezin took the time to write down the recipes they recalled from their time before the war. Unlike the other cookbooks, the recipes were not recalled fondly; rather, they were a painful fantasy for the authors of the recipes: "recalling recipes was an act of discipline that required them to suppress their current hunger and to think of the ordinary world before the camps – and perhaps to dare to dream of a world after the camps" (De Silva, 1996, p. xvi).

The story of how the cookbook presented *In Memory's Kitchen* came to be is not exact or precise. It is filled with potential inaccuracies and uncertainties, but too many have died for these questions to be resolved. The story that is known is that Mina Pächter, just before dying in Terezin, entrusted the hand-written cookbook to her antiques dealer friend, Arthur Buxbaum, asking him to get it to her daughter Anny in Palestine. With no address for Mina's daughter, Arthur simply held onto the package until 1960, when a cousin told him she was heading to Israel. By the time the cousin heard any word of Anny, and her husband George Stern, they had moved to the United States. It is uncertain exactly what happened next, but, somehow, the cookbook was entrusted to another to be carried to New York. As Anny tells the story, "a stranger from Ohio arrived at a Manhattan gathering of Czechs and asked if anyone knew the Sterns" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxvii). And so, a decade after the cookbook reached Palestine, Anny received the package with her mother's handwritten cookbook in New York City.

Even less is known about the actual cookbook. Mina's original *kochbuch* is written in Czech and its contributors appear to be raised in the traditions of the Czechoslovak kitchen. Despite coming from such a rich tradition, Mina's cookbook is difficult to use in the modern day, as many of the recipes are muddled or simply incomplete:

> In some an ingredient is left out (the bean torte, for instance, usually requires an egg; the cream strudel has no dough); in others a process is omitted (dumplings are made and sauced without ever being cooked). Steps are inverted, and punctuation, too, is often nonexistent or perplexing" (De Silva, 1996, p. xli).

These are all left preserved in the text; the cookbook is entirely unedited, so as to not "violate history" by "misrepresent[ing] the experiences of the women who produced them" (De Silva, 1996, xlii).

In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy From the Women of Terezin (published in 1996) is Mina's collection of recipes alongside letters Mina wrote to her family and poetry written by Mina. Before any of this, there are introductory chapters that tell Mina's story, provide background on Terezin and food talk during the Holocaust, and encourage the reader to understand this cookbook in a particular way.

The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook

The *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* (originally published in 2007) was born from a need to fundraise for an Israeli soup kitchen and has since raised over $180,000 for Carmei Ha'ir Soup Kitchen in Jerusalem. 100 recipes and stories were collected by Joanne Caras from survivors all over the world, including the United States, Canada, South America, Israel, Australia, New Zealand, Europe, South Africa, and Asia. Some of these stories are very detailed, "as the Survivors took advantage of this forum to share . . . their entire journey. Others were reluctant to

give too many details. Some told us that they had never before told their story to their own children" (Caras, 2007). Each of these recipes is a family recipe, usually handed down through several generations.

The recipes were left unedited and untested. As a result, some of the recipes are "lacking in detail that would help in the preparation of the food," while "others suggest variations on the basic recipe" and still others are very detailed (Caras, 2007). Looking at the three cookbooks writ large, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* is a middle ground: its recipes are sometimes not exactly complete or a little difficult to cook, but the recipes are meant to be used. The introduction to the cookbook encourages readers to try the recipes, to modify them, or to "use them as a starting point to let your imagination go" (Caras, 2007). What is important, Caras argues, is that cookbook users "remember the history that they contain" and that "whenever you serve a recipe from [the] cookbook to your family," the cook "read[s] them the story of the Survivor that goes with the Recipe" (Caras, 2007).

Recipes Remembered

Of the three cookbooks, *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival* (published in 2011) is the most like a traditional cookbook: the recipes, side by side with memoirs of survivors, are tested and edited. After months of work by June Feiss Hersh, they are meant to be used by readers with ease.

In her introduction, Hersch describes the difficulty in sometimes creating usable recipes. Many dishes, she found, were passed down without recipe, learned by watching mothers and grandmothers in the kitchen: "many of these cooks prepare from instinct and memory, from taste and smell or by *shitteryne*; Yiddish for without a recipe, a little of this and a little of that" (Hersch, 2011, p. 13). Other times, survivors recalled a recipe but did not know how to recreate

it: “a technique that was watched but not learned, a flavor that was lost but not forgotten” (Hersch, 2011, p. 13). In these situations, Hersh brought in professional chefs, cookbook authors, and restaurateurs to help recreate the recipe. Sometimes, the final recipe is exactly as the survivor described, other times it is inspired by a survivor’s recollections. As a result, these recipes are meant to reflect a regional cuisine and, above all, to honor the survivor’s food memory.

> The preface of *Recipes Remembered* begins by reminding us that food is important: there is no doubt that memories of food and the social context of food – preparing it and partaking of it – are among the most potent that humans have. One need not read Proust to understand the capacity for food to unlock powerful memories and to transport us through time. Whatever explanation we seek – brain chemistry or something less clinical – we have all experienced how an aroma or a particular flavor can take us to another place. (Hersch, 2011, p. 11)

This cookbook, much like the other two, explicitly describes the importance of food. A single smell is enough to transport us to a different time and place. On a personal level, food can remind us of our childhood or a specific time or place. It can remind us of a family member, friend or particularly emotional time – whether happy or sad. This was true for those that lived through the Holocaust as well. Whether recalling recipes during or after the Holocaust, Hersch argues that these cookbooks allow us to see “how individuals whose lives were disrupted or torn apart by the events of World War II and the Holocaust retain intense memories of the food they enjoyed in happier times. It is as if food were a grain of sand around which pearls of memory were formed, enduring as tokens of a lost world and time” (Hersch, 2011, p. 11).

Memories of food, much like pearls, remain strong over time, growing steadily while waiting to be re-discovered. The recipes within these cookbooks can be understood in the same way: the recipes continue to exist over time, lying in wait in cookbooks to be prepared by the fourth generation, to be shared with friends, to become a part of someone's identity.

In this way, *Recipes Remembered* is similar to *In Memory's Kitchen*, the cookbook it is furthest from on the continuum. *In Memory's Kitchen* offers us a literal look into how women in Terezin managed to survive: through food talk. *Recipes Remembered*, though a collection of recipes not literally from the Holocaust, asks readers to understand the recipes in the same way - as a mechanism for not just memory but also survival:

> Of course, just as recollections of food populate the prewar memories of the people whose stories are told in these pages, memories of the absence of food often plague those who experienced the hardships of war and persecution. In this sense, the memories-and recipes- revealed in this book have a special significance. Not only do they link to happier times, but they are, in a way, also antidotes to the poisonous periods of anguish and deprivation. One of the most powerful stories of our time remains how those who endured the worst – unceasing hatred, unpredictable violence, unimaginable trauma – found the best in themselves and mustered fortitude and resolve to choose life and to rebuild their lives. (Hersch, 2011, p. 11)

Ultimately, these cookbooks are mechanisms not just for survival in harsh conditions but to ensure the survival of the Jewish people and their culture.

Methodology

In the following chapters, I offer a close reading and analysis of *In Memory's Kitchen, The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered*. There are several reasons to limit

my study to three cookbooks. The first is practical: though there are several other pieces of "cookbooks" (collections of recipes written down on scraps of paper) written *in* the camps, *In Memory's Kitchen* is the only one that is published, easily accessible, and does not require travel and/or special permissions to access. And, as it is the most complete, it offers the best material for rhetorical study of a cookbook from the concentration and death camps. And, as it is published and translated, it does not require extra translating, handwriting deciphering, etc.

Second, though there are actually four published Holocaust cookbooks, the fourth is a sequel to *The Holocaust Survivors Cookbook*. Thus, it is identical in themes, organization, and narrative structure to its predecessor. Limiting my reading and analysis to *In Memory's Kitchen, The Holocaust Survivor's Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* offers manageable parameters for analysis and is sufficient material to be studied.

Third, all three cookbooks do offer similar themes in the narrative created by the book and within recipes to some extent. Thus, analyzing them together offers a more fruitful investigation than if any were considered in isolation.

Finally, I have chosen to analyze the cookbooks, rather than the food or cooking of the food in and of itself. A study that focused more on the materiality of the food itself would be illuminating but is outside the scope of my study. I am more interested in the way the cookbooks, as a text, work to reframe Holocaust memory and Jewish identity. As the text and recipes inside each cookbook are a first step towards actually making the food, it seems necessary to analyze these, for it is the narratives and recipes within the cookbooks that would provide the framework for cooking to begin with.

To do this analysis, I first read each cookbook as a complete book, looking to see what similarities and differences exist between not just the narratives associated with each recipe, but

also in the introductory chapter(s) of each book, where the purpose and potential uses of the book is outlined. Also included in my attention to each cookbooks narrative is the way the books are structured: are they organized by country? By person? By type of recipe (such as breakfast, lunch, and dinner or poultry and dairy)? I also offer a close reading of the recipes themselves, paying careful attention to how they draw on traditional Jewish ingredients and how they differ. How does each cookbook define "Jewish food?" And how might this impact or change fourth generation Jews? I am specifically interested in (1) the narratives that are told and the memory work they do and (2) the way the recipes are presented and how those recipes may emphasize a certain way of remembering the Holocaust or Jewish identity.

Conclusion

Though academics and especially rhetoricians have long identified the importance of food and foodways, they have yet to give much attention to the interaction between rhetoric, food studies, and collective memory. Further, though much Jewish culture and religion revolves around food, there has yet to be attention paid to the way food may be used as a mechanism for Holocaust remembrance. Thus, doing a rhetorical analysis and close reading of these three Holocaust-related cookbooks offers a unique opportunity to contribute to two growing fields of academic inquiry. *In Memory's Kitchen*, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, *and Recipes Remembered* represent a potentially new way of remembering the Holocaust and a new means for fourth generation Jews (who are largely secular) to identify as Jews.

This thesis will proceed in four parts. In this first chapter, I lay out the ingredients, offering a context in which to understand these cookbooks. In Chapter Two, I examine the narratives within and created by these cookbooks, looking not just at the narratives of survivors in the cookbooks, but also at the narrative created by the cookbook in its introduction and

organization. In this chapter, I argue that these cookbooks create a more optimistic way of remembering the Holocaust, focusing on survival through the Holocaust. In Chapter Three, I examine the recipes of each cookbook in the context of Jewish food culture, arguing these cookbooks are part of a creative, inventional process where new collective Jewish identifies are formed. Finally, I put the dish together in a concluding chapter, analyzing how these cookbooks may change Holocaust remembrance and fourth generation Jewish American identity.

References

Bardenstein, C. (2002). "Transmissions Interrupted: Reconfiguring Food, Memory, and Gender in the Cookbook-Memoirs of Middle Eastern Exiles." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, *28*(1), 353-87.

Caras, J. (2007). *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook: Collected from around the World*. Port St. Lucie, FL: Caras & Associates.

DeSilva, C. (1996). *In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy from the Women of Terezin*. Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, Inc

Eves, R.C. (2005). A Recipe for Remembrance: Memory and Identity in African American Women's Cookbooks. *Rhetoric Review*, *24*(3), 280-297.

Halbwachs, M. (1992). *On Collective Memory*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Hersh, J.F. (2011). *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival*. New York, NY: Museum of Jewish Heritage

Holtzman, J.D. (2006). Food and Memory. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, *35*, 361-378.

Merwin, T. (2015). *Pastrami Rye: An Overstuffed History of the Jewish Deli*. New York, NY: NYU Press.

Sutton, D.E. (2001). *Remembrance of Repasts: An Anthropology of Food and Memory*. Oxford, UK: Bloomsburg Academic.

Young, A., Eckstein, J., Conley, D. (2015). Rhetorics and Foodways. *Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies*, *12*(2), 198-199

Chapter Two – Crafting a Narrative of Survival

The Holocaust has become a central part of Jewish collective memory. In the process of narrativizing the Holocaust into broader Jewish history, however, the Holocaust has come to occupy a tenuous position. It is simultaneously a defining event in Jewish history, so terrible in scope and loss that it stands apart from all the rest of Jewish history, and just another tragedy in a long history of Jewish tragedies. In the latter, the Holocaust is just more of the same; it is so unremarkable that it does not require revision to the narrative of Jewish history itself. Still, in either case, much of Holocaust memory is focused on the enormous loss and sadness of the Holocaust. In this chapter, I argue that *In Memory's Kitchen*, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* stand apart from this, offering a more hopeful and optimistic view of the Holocaust, choosing to focus on the strength of Jews to survive through the Holocaust rather than all that was lost. As a result, these cookbooks change the way in which the Holocaust fits into the narrative of Jewish history. Further, as two of the cookbooks ask readers to actually cook these recipes, the cookbooks are able to re-create the past in the present. Instead of focusing on loss, the cookbooks attempt to bring what was lost into the present. To analyze this new way of remembering the Holocaust, this chapter proceeds in three parts. First, I will describe the history of creating a narrative of Jewish history. Second, I will examine the most common forms and themes of Holocaust memory in order to demonstrate how and why these cookbooks are distinct. Finally, I analyze the cookbooks themselves; offering insights into the way the narratives found within these cookbooks change typical Holocaust remembrance.

The Jewish Narrative

The history of the Jews is often difficult for a historian or storyteller or museum curator to tell. Jews are a small minority whose history spans millennia and continents. Even within the

same timeframe, Jews of Eastern Europe and Iran, for instance, have very different circumstances and hardships. Thus, the historian has "the difficult task of deciding how he (or she) will connect the chronological, geographical, and thematic levels in a way that will be the least confusing for the reader" (Brenner, 2010, p. 17). Then, historians must deal with their own ideological and political purposes. Think, for example, of the different Jewish histories that a Zionist versus a non-Zionist might tell.

Despite all of this, one view of Jewish history has proven the most salient and resilient across time. The lachrymose view of Jewish history, which was popular mostly before the 20th century has re-emerged in recent decades as a result of the Holocaust and heightened anti-Semitism across the globe. For historians of this view, the Jews have an unremittingly bleak story; they are "persecuted victims, living tenuously in a hostile world" (Satlow, 2011). This view understands Jewish history as essentially a string of tragedies punctuating a life rife with anti-Semitism and hardship. It is easy to see why this view may have lost and then re-gained popularity. The lachrymose view permeates Jewish histories, but also Jewish museums and especially Holocaust memorial sites. Thus, explaining the lachrymose view of Jewish history is essential, as it makes clear how different *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* are in contrast.

Salo Baron's *A Social and Religious History of the Jews* (published in 1937) is the first major historical work to attempt to integrate Jewish suffering into a broader history, to create a narrative of Jewish history that was *not* lachrymose. In Baron's mind, "suffering is part of the destiny [of the Jews] but so is repeated joy as well as ultimate redemption" (Steinfels, 1989). After the Holocaust, the lachrymose view that Baron fought against found popularity again in fields of Jewish philosophy and theology. The lachrymose view was, unsurprisingly, of

particular importance to Zionists, who understood Israel as the only potential solution to the ongoing tragedies suffered by the Jewish people. In the academic study of Jewish history, however, the Holocaust occupied a more peculiar position in that "the Holocaust has not yet had any particular impact on modern Jewish historiography . . . [and] has . . . led to no thoroughgoing revision of our understanding of modern Jewish history" (Engel, 2002, p. 3). That is to say, for current Jewish historians, the Holocaust is deemed unimportant to Jewish history in that it does not change the modern views of Jewish history. It is bracketed off from Jewish history, not a part of it – in Jewish Studies departments, one is not a Jewish historian who specializes in the Holocaust, but a Holocaust historian. This is not dissimilar from the way the Holocaust is treated writ large, however, despite its dominance in Jewish consciousness.

The Holocaust is certainly a dominant theme in Jewish studies. When looking for books on Jewish history on Amazon, one is given two options – to look for books in "General Jewish History" or "Holocaust" (Engel, 2002, p. 1). Even in non-academic settings, the Holocaust is bracketed off from the rest of Jewish history. However, the Holocaust is also treated as essential to the Jewish story. In brick-and-mortar bookstores, books about the Holocaust – even those that are not directly or explicitly related to Jews – are shelved with books relating to "Judaism" or "the Jewish people." These may include volumes such as *The Nazi Persecution of the Gypsies*, *The Face of the Third Reich: Portraits of the Nazi Leadership*, *Hitler's Austria: Popular Sentiment in the Nazi Era*, *Tearing the Silence: On Being German in America*, *Hitler's Traitor: Martin Bormann and the Defeat of the Reich*, and *Nuremberg: Infamy on Trial*. In none of these books are Jews the subject (or object) of the books. However, though they might be shelved more appropriately in an area about World War II, they are all (as they are related to the Holocaust) found alongside other books about Jews. Even books that decry viewing the

Holocaust as exclusively Jewish (such as *The Forgotten Holocaust: The Poles under German Occupation* and *A Little Matter of Genocide: Holocaust and Denial in the Americas*) "have on their way to the bookstore been transformed, *mirabile dictu*, into 'Jewish" books' (Engel, 2002, p. 1).

Within the practice of Judaism as well, the Holocaust receives this same sort of bracketing. Outside of academia, remembering, especially remembering loss, is of particular importance for Judaism. For religious Jews, there is an entire day, Tisha B'av, devoted to mourning and commemorating the tragedies the Jewish people have faced. The day is primarily meant to commemorate the destruction of the first and second temples in 586 B.C.E. and 70 C.E. respectively. However, as time has gone on and more tragedies have occurred, the day is also used to mourn and remember expulsions (from England in 1290, from France in 1306, and from Spain in 1492) and various other instances of bloodshed, such as various massacres in Jewish towns during the Crusades, the Battle for Jerusalem in the late 1940s, or the 1994 bombing of a Jewish community center in Buenos Aires. For religious Jews, this is a significant day marked with sorrow; in Israel, all restaurants and entertainment venues are required to be closed on Tisha B'av.

However, despite the existence of a day in the Jewish calendar designated for mourning and remembrance of tragedy, there has been a widespread effort to separate the Holocaust from this day, to mark it as separate "in kind and in magnitude from other tragedies" (Brown, 2000, p. 108). Thus, in Israel and around the world, Jews use Yom HaShoah as a day exclusively for the remembrance and mourning of the six million Jews who were murdered during the Holocaust. In Israel, Yom HaShoah begins at sundown[5] with a ceremony that includes lowering the flags to

[5] In the Jewish calendar, days are sundown to sundown. Thus, Yom HaShoah begins with a ceremony at sundown because that is when the day begins in the Jewish calendar.

half mast (where they will remain until sundown the following day) and lighting six torches to symbolize the six million that perished. At sundown, all places of public entertainment close (and remain closed until sundown the following day). During the day, Holocaust documentaries and other Holocaust-related programming airs on television. At 10:00 AM, air raid sirens sound and everyone observes a two-minute silence. At this time, even those driving cars stop and stand next to their cars for the moment of silence.

The Holocaust is treated as categorically different from other Jewish tragedies, bracketed off as not quite part of Jewish history. Largely, this might be because the Holocaust is considered by many Jewish historians to be fundamentally different from previous Jewish tragedies. Historian Jacob Talmon explains:

> Never since the dawn of history had the world witnessed such a campaign of extermination. This was not an explosion of Religious fanaticism; not a wave of pogroms, the work of incited mobs running amok . . . not the riots of a soldiery gone wild or drunk with victory and wine; not the fear-wrought psychosis of revolution or civil war that rises and subsides like a whirlwind . . . An entire nation was handed over by a 'legitimate' government to murderers organized by the authorities and trained to hunt and kill, with one single provision, that everyone, the entire nation be murdered . . . without any chance of even one of those condemned to extermination escaping his fate. (Gutman & Schatzker, 1984, p. 237)

Talmon goes on to argue that the Holocaust is different precisely because of its "conscious and explicit planning," and because Jews did not have the option to surrender or flee. Instead, they were "brought from the four corners of Hitlerite Europe to the death camps to be killed . . . by the murderers bullets over graves dug by the victims themselves, or in slaughterhouses

constructed especially for human beings" (Gutman & Schatzker, 1984, p. 237). As a result of this difference, the Holocaust stands apart, bracketed off from the rest of Jewish history. However, it still remains an essential part of Jewish studies and understanding the Jewish people. Perhaps the inability to weave the Holocaust into the Jewish story (instead of treating it as entirely separate) is a result of the unimaginable loss faced by the Jewish people as a result of the Holocaust.

Loss and the Holocaust

Focus on loss is certainly the primary theme for remembering the Holocaust. At museums, memorials, and other "places" of Holocaust remembrance, focus on loss is abundant and obvious. For example, piles of victim's shoes are featured in exhibits at Yad Vashem, the United States Holocaust Memorial and Museum, and at the museums at Auschwitz and Majdaneck, to name a few. These piles are meant to represent absence (Cole, 2000) and to compel visitors to feel overwhelmed by the loss of those who once owned the shoes. Shoes are also prominent in Shoes on the Danube, a memorial in Budapest that memorializes the 3,500 victims who were shot into the Danube River by the Arrow Cross party.[6] Again, these shoes are meant to invoke memory of those who are not there.

In other places, such as the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum and the New England Holocaust Memorial, names of prominently Jewish towns that were wiped out by the Nazis are listed. This, again, is meant to invoke loss. As the list of these names goes on and on, the visitor is meant to feel an overwhelming sense of loss. At the Holocaust Memorial Center in Budapest, the list of names is not of towns, but of Hungarian Jews killed during the Holocaust. The names may change, but the effect is still the same.

[6] The Arrow Cross Party was the Nazi-aligned party in Hungary. They were in power on and off as Hungary switched sides in the war.

In architecture too, symbolism of loss is prominent. At the Jewish Museum Berlin, empty spaces (called "Voids") slice through the building. These voids are used "to address the physical emptiness that resulted from the expulsion, destruction, and annihilation of Jewish life in the Shoah, which cannot be refilled after the fact. He [the architect] wanted to make this loss visible and tangible through architecture" ("The Libeskind Building"). The Judenplatz Holocaust Memorial (also called the Nameless Library) in Vienna, Austria depicts a library whose books are all turned around on the shelves, so the names of the books on the spines cannot be seen or read. This way, the titles and contents of the books remain unknown. Much like the Jewish Museum Berlin, the unknowable books are meant to represent the loss experienced by Jews during the Holocaust. The Empty Library Memorial in Bebelplatz in Berlin relies on similar imagery. At this memorial, visitors look through a glass pane in the ground. Underneath them, visible through the glass, is a room of empty shelves. The empty shelves are, again, meant to invoke loss, to serve as a reminder of the knowledge lost during the Holocaust. In Yad Vashem's Hall of Names, bookcases are also prominently featured. The Hall of Names features a ten-meter high cone displaying hundreds of photographs of Jews that died during the Holocaust. Surrounding this cone are large bookshelves that house the Pages of Testimony. In these are short biographies of Jews that were killed in the Holocaust. So far, biographical information has only been found for two million Jews that were murdered during the Holocaust. The bookshelves house the biographies of these two million, but they are mostly empty space that will one day be filled with the biographies of the full six million. Thus, there are large spaces of empty bookshelf, emphasizing the enormity of the loss – so much is known about so many that perished, but a great deal more is left unknown, perhaps lost forever.

Focus on loss is prominent in other forms of Holocaust remembrance as well. So far, I have only discussed the way loss is symbolized at memorials, monuments, and museums. However, despite the existence of hundreds of Holocaust memorials across the globe, this is often not how most people engage in Holocaust remembrance. The most common form of remembrance remains telling the stories of individual people. "First-hand survivor interviews and accounts," Brown proclaims, are "the most significant act of contemporary memorialization of the Holocaust" (Brown, 2000, p. 109). In other words, Americans tend to use narratives, not memorials and museums, as a primary means of remembering the Holocaust.

Many collections of memoirs of Holocaust survivors and their children exist. These exist in print, such as Elinor Brecher's *Schindler's Legacy* or Victoria Aaron's *Third Generation Holocaust Narratives* and also in film. Brown points to Claude Lanzmann's *Shoah* as a prime example: "in faltering English and often without the chronology that we have come to expect of history, survivors recount personal horrors" (Brown, 2000, p. 109). The well known *The Diary of Anne Frank*, *The Pianist*, *Defiance* and *Schindler's List* also all fall within this category. More recently, *Ida* (winner of the 2014 Academy Award for Best Foreign Language Film) and *Son of Saul* (winner of the 2015 Golden Globe for Best Foreign Language Film and nominated for the Academy Award for Best Foreign Language Film) also fall within this form of commemoration, as all of these utilize individual storytelling as a means to understand the Holocaust.

Beyond popular culture texts of the Holocaust, museums also often express Holocaust memory via narratives. Some museums, such as Yad Vashem, express collection of these narratives as the primary and explicit purpose of the museum. Beyond merely collecting narratives, however, museums also teach Holocaust history through memoir. The prime example

is The United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, which asks its visitors to walk through the permanent collection with the narrative of someone who lived during the Holocaust.

Schools also use memoir or narrative as a mechanism for teaching about the Holocaust. Across the country, states require students to learn about the Holocaust ("Beyond Our Walls"). This is often done via reading popular Holocaust memoirs, such as *The Diary of Anne Frank* or Elie Wiesel's *Night*. Even the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, which offers a great deal of teacher resources, encourages teachers to use memoirs as a way to present Holocaust history:

> In any study of the Holocaust, the sheer number of victims challenges easy comprehension. Show that individual people . . . are behind the statistics and emphasize the diversity of personal experiences within the larger historical narrative . . . first-person accounts and memoir literature add individual voices to a collective experience and help students make meaning out of the statistics. ("Guidelines for Teaching About the Holocaust", para. 14)

Memoirs are a way to learn about and understand the Holocaust in a way that students cannot get from a textbook or other means. Brown also expresses this, arguing, "in the aggregate, such personal recollections are an important lens through which to view recent history. Statistics, dates, and geographic locations are also part of our collective memory of the Holocaust, but these often command less attention than first-hand accounts" (Brown, 2000, p. 109). And that is why even beyond school, access to Holocaust memoirs is abundant: "whereas testimonies had previously been confined to archives," they are now "abundan[t] and ubiquitous… in the public sphere" (Wieviorka, 2006, p. xii). It's important to note here that though memoirs have remained a constant in the primary means of Holocaust memory, the nature of these narratives have

changed through the decades. Now, as we draw closer to an era where all Holocaust survivors have died of natural causes, testimonies of survivors are increasingly "replaced by more literary and aesthetic forms of recall, a natural consequence of distance from the event itself" (Brown, 2000, p. 110). Prominent recent examples include Jodi Picoult's *The Storyteller*, Martha Hall Kelly's *The Lilac Girls*, and Affinity Konar's *Mischling*.

It is easy to understand why these memoirs have remained a constant mechanism for remembering and have even proliferated, as they serve an important function emerging from "the will or need to remember, to resurrect an annihilated world with printed words. It is a collective work of mourning that seeks, through stories and photographs, to reconstitute the lost object on paper" (Wieviorka, 2006, p. 26). Beyond this, memoirs are also critical in supporting the pedagogical function of "never forgetting." Brouwer and Horwitz (2015) argue that to "Never Forget" is an imperative of all Holocaust memory (pp. 548-550). Memoirs, in an obvious way, might fulfill this "never forgetting," as reading narratives from the Holocaust ensures we will remember that the Holocaust happened.

In many of these personal accounts, the lachrymose view of Jewish history is present, as many place their own tragedy in line with other calamities on the timeline of Jewish history. Others simply paint the Holocaust "as the central act of suffering of the Jewish people, incomparable to any other, a signal of the impending doom of Jewish nationhood" (Brown, 2000, p. 109). David Roskies (1984) describes this as "basically two approaches to draw upon from the fund of ancient and modern sources: one that imploded history, and one that made the Holocaust the center of apocalypse" (Roskies, p. 226). Here again, the tenuous position of the Holocaust is clear. For some, it is just another tragedy in a long line of tragedies. For others, it is bracketed off, a calamity on such a scale that it cannot be understood within the rest of Jewish

history. *In Memory's Kitchen*, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered*, however, offer a different view of Holocaust memory and memoir, choosing to focus on survival instead of loss. Next, I will turn to an analysis of these cookbooks to show how they reframe Holocaust memory, integrating into a broader Jewish narrative about overcoming and surviving through tragedies.

How Holocaust Cookbooks Can Overcome Loss

Though *In Memory's Kitchen*, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* are all cookbooks related to the Holocaust, they are quite different from one another. *In Memory's Kitchen* focuses on the narrative of Mina Pächter and treats its recipes as artifacts. The cookbook would be more at home in a museum, next to a collection of objects taken from the camps, than in a kitchen's cookbook shelf. The other two cookbooks are very much meant to find a home in the kitchen, but they still have varying degrees of editorial control. *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* presents its recipes as they were submitted – untested, unaltered, unedited. *Recipes Remembered*, on the other hand, is tried and true. Its recipes are tested and it is meant to be used with ease. And yet, all three cookbooks frame their recipes as a hope for the future and as a mechanism for survival. This is done by all three cookbooks in a few ways.

First, there is an expanded view of what it means to be a "survivor" of the Holocaust. While each cookbook features many survivors who survived one or more of the labor, concentration, or death camps, the cookbooks take a broader view and include any Jew who survived being in Germany or any Nazi-occupied or aligned country in Europe during WWII. Some, such as Elizabath Silberstein, Eva Roitman, and Jacques Fein (whose narratives are featured in the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*) survived by being hidden in covenants or

pretending to be Catholic. Others, such as Anna Steinberger, Betty and Lester Drang, and Abram Roitman (whose narratives are in the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*) survived by fleeing to (or being stuck in) Russia. Still others survived by being part of the Kindertransport program, such as Ellen Wolf (whose story is found in the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*) or the Rubach family (whose narrative is in *Recipes Remembered*). Finally, some survived by becoming partisans (*Recipes Remembered* features several interviews with Bielski partisans and those that fought alongside them) or by simply fleeing to and hiding in the woods, such as the Kushner family featured in *Recipes Remembered.* In expanding the view of who counts as a survivor, the cookbooks emphasize how many survived and the strength needed to survive. By expanding the definition of survivor, emphasis is placed on the strength in survival.

Despite differences in where they came from, lifestyles they had before the war, how they survived, and where they settled after, the survivors in these cookbooks all have one thing in common: food. Or, more specifically, they use food as a mechanism for memory, for survival, and for bringing the past and what was lost into the present:

> Prior to the war, they had enjoyed memorable meals and family gatherings. They learned about secret ingredients and timeless traditions. They came from cities with regional specialties, indigenous spices, local flavors and distinctive techniques. Through it all, one important constant was the food they remembered. (*Recipes Remembered*, 2011, p.12)

For many in the Holocaust, memories of food and the hopes to pass recipes on was enough to give them the hope needed to survive. When food became scarce, food memories became a source of sustenance. Hersh articulates this in the introduction to *Recipes Remembered:*

> Of course, just as recollections of food populate the prewar memories of the people whose stories are told in these pages, memories of the absence of food often plague those

> who experienced the hardships of war and persecution. In this sense, the memories - and recipes – revealed in this book have a special significance. Not only do they link to happier times, but they are, in a way, also antidotes to the poisonous periods of anguish and deprivation. One of the most powerful stories of our time remains how those who endured the worst – unceasing hatred, unpredictable violence, unimaginable trauma – found the best in themselves and mustered the fortitude and resolve to choose life and to rebuild their lives. Surely in this precarious and uniquely personal journey, they were strengthened along the way by warm memories of the kind that animate this book" ("Recipes Remembered," 2011, p. 11)

What's remarkable across all three cookbooks is the focus on survival through the Holocaust. As a researcher of Holocaust memory, my research is often plagued with sadness. So much of Holocaust memory and remembrance focuses on the inconceivable and irreparable loss of the Holocaust. These three cookbooks stand apart from that. They are hopeful, optimistic, and give emphasis to the incredible courage and strength of survivors. They emphasize not only the survival of Jews through the Holocaust, but also the hope that Jewish survivors can recreate Jewish culture in the present. Further, many survivors focus on the kindness of strangers that enabled them to survive. In the next section, I will turn to looking at each cookbook individually to demonstrate the positive focus of each.

In Memory's Kitchen

In Memory's Kitchen stands apart from the other two cookbooks. It is not only the sole cookbook written *in* a concentration camp, but also the only cookbook that focuses on a single narrative. Though the cookbook itself is a collection of recipes written by several women, *In Memory's Kitchen* focuses on the story of Mina Pächter. The book begins with a preface, written

by the director of the US Holocaust Research Institute. Following the preface is an introduction, written by Cara De Silva, who translated the cookbook, letters, and poems and put the book together. Next, is Mina's cookbook itself, followed by poems written by Mina, letters she exchanged with her family, and a biographical sketch. *In Memory's Kitchen* is also unique in its lack of editorial control – the recipes are left unedited in any way. Unlike the other cookbooks, there is no encouragement to make the recipes. Rather, the recipes are treated more like historical artifacts. Despite this, there is still an emphasis on how these recipes would have been used as a means of survival for those that contributed to the cookbook.

In both the preface and the introduction, there is an emphasis on food and, more importantly, "food talk" being used as a mechanism for survival through the camps. This is mentioned in *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* as well; it was talking about food and remembering life before the war that gave those trapped in ghettos and camps and in hiding the will to persevere. Unlike in the other two collections of recipes, however, *In Memory's Kitchen* focuses on this food talk, which will be discussed in depth in Chapter Three. However, it's important to note here that sharing recipes is emphasized as a means of survival. For example:

> For some, the way to deal with this hunger was to repress the past . . . Not so the woman who compiled this cookbook. They talked of the past; they dared to think of food, to dwell on what they were missing – pots and pans, a kitchen, home, family, guests, meals, entertainment. Therefore, this cookbook compiled by . . . by starving women in Theresienstadt, must be seen as yet another manifestation of defiance, of a spiritual revolt against the harshness of given conditions. It is a flight of the imagination back to an earlier time when food was available, when women had homes and kitchens and could

> provide a meal for their children. The fantasy must have been painful for the authors. Recalling recipes was an act of discipline that required them to suppress their current hunger and to think of the ordinary world before the camps – and perhaps to dream of a world after the camps. (De Silva, 1996, p. xv-xvi)

The introduction reminds the reader that the cookbook they are about to read is a reflection of strength in terrible circumstances. It is a reflection of the hope that these women had. Hope that they would some day return to their own kitchens and families and cook for them. And hope that they would be able to pass their recipes on to their daughters. For Mina and her fellow recipe-writers, creating a cookbook was an act of defiance and resistance, for they dared to dream of the Third Reich's failure and of the ability to pass on their culture to future children and grandchildren.

Holocaust Survivor Cookbook

The *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, unlike *In Memory's Kitchen*, is not an artifact – it is meant to be used as a cookbook. The cookbook begins with an introduction that tells the story of how the cookbook came to be. Motivated by the need to raise money for a soup kitchen in Israel, the editors of the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* decided to put together a collection of survivors' narratives and recipes.

What sets the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* apart from the other two cookbooks is its attention to survivors' stories. For the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook,* it is the narratives shared by survivors that are more important than the recipes shared. This emphasis is done in several ways. First, the introduction makes note of the wide variety of places survivors' stories came from, instead of making note of the wide variety of recipes given by those survivors: "this cookbook contains stories from across the United States, Canada, South America, Israel,

Australia, New Zealand, Europe, South Africa, and even some that came from people who escaped to Asia" (Caras, 2007, Introduction, para 6). Note that the cookbook contains *stories* from across the world, not *recipes*.

Second, Caras says several times that she wants readers to share the stories of survivors when a reader uses a recipe. In the second part of the cookbook, a section called "How to Use this Cookbook," Caras says the most important thing you can do when using this cookbook is to share the stories:

> We hope that you will open this cookbook often and use all of the recipes you find inside. And when you do use the cookbook here is the most important thing you can do. **Whenever you serve a recipe from this cookbook to your family please be sure to read them the story of the Survivor that goes with the recipe.** As your family enjoys their meal hopefully they will make time to discuss the story they have heard. By doing this you will keep both the recipes and the stories alive for generations to come. (Caras, 2007, "How to Use This Cookbook," paras. 3-6, bold in original)

Certainly, Caras and her team want the reader to make the recipe, but, more importantly, they want the story of the recipe's submitter to be shared. Caras further emphasizes the survivors in the introduction when she argues: "this cookbook is an opportunity for all of us to honor the courage, determination, intelligence, and fortune of those Survivors" (Caras, 2007, Introduction, para. 8).

Third, the cookbook itself is organized in such a way as to emphasize the survivors. The *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* has two tables of contents. The first is organized alphabetically by survivor. The second is organized by type of dish – appetizers, salads, breads, soups, kugels,

main dishes, side dishes, cakes, cookies pies and other desserts and Passover recipes. The order of these tables of contents tells the reader that Caras wishes to emphasize the survivor and encourage the reader to read the book cover to cover, instead of simply looking for a particular type of recipe. That is, Caras hopes to honor the survivor first and preserve a food culture second. Further, unlike in *Recipes Remembered* (which asks survivors to recall recipes from before the war), the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* simply asks survivors for recipes of dishes they like to eat or cook. Thus, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* has recipes like *Arroz con Pollo*, which an Eastern European survivor would most likely not have made before the war.

Finally, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* is similar to *In Memory's Kitchen* in its lack of editorial control. The narratives and recipes submitted for the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* are not edited or tested. Caras, the editor of the cookbook, explains this decision:

> These are family recipes, in many cases handed down through several generations. They are as we received them and they have not been "tested" as many cookbooks do. Many are lacking in detail that would help in the preparation of the food, others suggest several variations on the basic recipe, and others are very detailed. Try them, accept them as they are, modify them, or use them as a starting point to let your imagination go. Remember the history that they contain. (Caras, 2007, introduction, para. 8)

The recipes are left unaltered or edited, even if they are missing a step in instructions or an ingredient that makes it more difficult to make the recipe. However, readers are encouraged to actually make the recipe and even to edit it on their own. It would be inappropriate, Caras believes, for her to edit the recipes. However, the reader may use the recipes as they wish so long as they remember the survivor and their history while using and sharing the recipe.

The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook emphasizes survival by drawing so much attention to the survivors. Caras brings the survivors to the forefront as if to say, "make these recipes for *tbem* so that *they* may be remembered. They survived the Holocaust, now they need you (the reader) to help them survive further." By featuring hopeful stories of survival, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* refocuses Holocaust memory away from loss and instead on survival. Further, this cookbook is filled with narratives that emphasize survival and hope.

Even for those survivors who do not explicitly talk about food in their submitted narratives, they still emphasize the remarkable-ness of their survival. For example, Sam Zerykier, who survived a Polish ghetto by pretending to be a carpenter, is described by his grandchildren as always focusing on survival when he tells his story:

> When you ask Zedie, Sam Zerykier, about the war, he begins by naming all of his family members, whom they married, and the names of their children. Clearly the most important thing about the war to him was not the horrors he endured, but the memories of the people who were lost.
>
> At many points in the story, Zedie talks of survival. "I knew if they not gonna kills me, I gonna survive," he comments. (Caras, 2007, pgs. 12-12)

For Zerykier, Holocaust memory is about survival and living through the Holocaust in order to ensure that no one is forgotten.

Many wish to avoid talking about the Holocaust entirely and instead focus on their choice to live a positive life and help others after the miracle of their survival. This is the case for Shoshana Greenwald who would not speak of her experiences during the war and instead tells stories of her "remarkable parents and their faith in G-d" (Caras, 2007, pp. 79-83). Her grandchildren write her narrative in the cookbook. They speak of how important it was for their

grandmother that they have a "sense of gratitude for blessings and sense of pride" (Caras, 2007, pp. 79-83). Her granddaughter writes: "my grandmother always reminds us how lucky we are and how special our ancestors were" (Caras, 2007. pp. 79-83).

Similarly, for Jacques Fein, who survived by being hidden with a Catholic family, life now must include helping others: "First, I was lucky to have survived, while many thousands of children and millions more were murdered. I received help among others from the UJA money in the 1940's. So, for me, it is payback time. Second, as Jews we are responsible for each other, and that is the focus of this life of mine" (Caras, 2007, p. 44).

For many other survivors in this cookbook, food and survival are explicitly linked. For example, Ellen Rosanski Wolf, who survived by fleeing to Great Britain via the Kindertransport program, makes specific recipes because they are symbolic of her survival:

> This simple recipe made the trip with Ellen from Germany. Like Ellen, it too survived. I believe that this cake is symbolic of the children on those trains. The matzoh in it represents the haste with which the children fled from Nazi Germany and the sweetness of the chocolate represents the childhood of which they were deprived.
>
> We serve this cake every Passover as our reminder. *Enjoy this at your Seder and never forget*. (Caras, 2007, p. 31, italics in original)

The italicized represents the sentiment of many of the survivors in this cookbook: you should enjoy this recipe as a means of never forgetting. You should remember those that did not survive by continuing their traditions, by enjoying what was not lost, what can still be recreated.

Often, the survivors or their family members that wrote their narratives submitted the recipes they did for similar reasons – it was the thing that their grandparent or parent always made for a specific occasion, or it was the recipe they knew best. Often, these recipes were

simple, everyday foods that they shared with their parents growing up. For example, Regina Weisz Wolovits associated a simple potato recipe with the great legacy left by her mother:

> As I was growing up in Cleveland, most of my friend's parents were American. I had the privilege of having European parents and the added benefit of experiencing and tasting all the great foods that my mother prepared from the recipes that she learned from her home in Europe. When I make this special potato recipe, I think how proud I am at the legacy she has given us. (Caras, 2007, p. 68)

By being able to make the potato recipe, Wolovitz is able to ensure her mother's survival beyond the Holocaust. Similarly, there are also many clear examples of this through the sheer volume of survivors that write about chicken soup in their narratives. For example, Ruth Steinfeld, who survived by being protected by an underground agency, explains how important making a good chicken soup was to her after being taken away from her mother at a young age:

> I wanted to be a good Jewish wife and part of that meant my cooking. I had no idea how to make a good soup. I do not remember exactly what my mother looked like, but I remembered the smell of her chicken soup. I worked on it till I felt I had my Mom in my kitchen. (Caras, 2007 p. 70)

Ruth Gans Mayer, who lived through five years in a concentration camp (and whose narrative is written by her daughter), emphasizes the importance of passing down recipes for simple foods like chicken soup: "Additionally, later in life my mother remembered a favorite recipe that her grandmother used to make. She was not well and knew her time was limited, so she wanted to be sure I knew how to make the whole matzo-matzo balls, just as her grandmother did" (Caras, 2007, p. 109). Finally, Gizela Solomon Farkas, also talks about the relationship between remembering her mother and chicken soup: "Both my mom and dad have passed away, but

whenever I want to conjure up a memory, I make either her chicken soup, which I'm sure you have many recipes for, or Lokshen mit case (noodles with cheese)" (Caras, 2007, p.192)

In each of these narratives, being able to reproduce the way a cherished family cooked a particular food, even in a simple food, was essential to survival. For these survivors, being able to recreate food memories from before the war is a means of their family surviving beyond it. Further, in the narratives that emphasize survival itself, there is a strength and optimism not present in usual ways of remembering the Holocaust. *Recipes Remembered*, the cookbook I will discuss next, is no different in its emphasis on survival.

Recipes Remembered

Recipes Remembered is, in some ways, on the opposite end of the spectrum from *In Memory's Kitchen*. It has the highest editorial control of all three of the cookbooks and most closely resembles a typical cookbook in both form and function. First, the recipes are not simply submitted by the survivor, as they are in the other two. Instead, June Feiss Hersh interviewed each survivor in her book. She asked them to recall recipes from before the war and, in many cases, watched them cook these recipes. In instances where the survivor recalled a recipe but did not know how to cook it, Hersh called in professional chefs or restaurateurs to help her recreate the recipe. In many cases, a survivor did not have a recipe written down or could not easily explain how to make a dish. This necessitated creating a cookbook that would be tried and tested:

> Many of these cooks prepare from instinct and memory, from taste and smell or by *shitteryne*; Yiddish for without a recipe, a little of this and a little of that. How much is a glass of oil or an eggshell of matzo meal? Is a *bisel* a teaspoon or a pinch? And what about those recipes written in shorthand or scribbled as illegible notes stained with

> cooking oil and sauce? How could I write a cookbook based on recipes that were loose formulas? It was then I knew I would test and re-test every recipe and write each precisely so that I could provide you with detailed introductions, recipe context, clear directions, consistent format and exact measurements. All have been reviewed and approved by the contributor. (Hersh, 2011, p. 13)

Similarly, the survivors in *Recipes Remembered* did not simply submit their narratives. Instead, Hersh writes most of the narratives after lengthy interviews and conversations. Even the narratives that were not the result of interviewing are edited for clarity, length, grammar, etc.

Further, unlike *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, *Recipes Remembered* is much more focused on the recipes and preserving food culture. First, the book is organized by country, with sections on Poland, Austria & Germany, Belgium & France, Hungary & Czechoslovakia, Romania & Russia & the Ukraine, and Greece. In *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, the narratives say where the survivor has submitted their narrative and recipe from and often the narratives start with where the person was born. In *Recipes Remembered*, the focus is on where the survivor comes from. Already, this tells the reader that there is an emphasis on recalling and preserving recipes, foods, and food cultures from specific areas.

At the beginning of each area section of the book is a page with a list of names and recipes and an explanation about the groupings of that country. Often, this explanation has a brief history or explains the characteristics of Jewish food culture in that area. Some of the recipes are distinctively specific to that country, while other recipes are not region-specific or no longer associated with a specific region. For example, Poland has recipes for matzo ball soup, noodle kugel, challah, and brisket. All of these recipes are now thought of as classic Jewish or even Jewish American recipes, despite their more regional origins.

Second, the introduction of the cookbook, written by the director of the Museum of Jewish Heritage in New York City, emphasizes the importance of food. For example:

> There is no doubt that memories of food and the social context of food – preparing it and partaking of it – are among the most potent that humans have. One need not read Proust to understand the capacity for food to unlock powerful memories and to transport us through time. Whatever explanation we seek – brain chemistry or something less clinical – we have all experienced how an aroma or a particular flavor can take us to another place. This meaningful and warmly written book – *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival* – is perfect proof of this phenomenon. Here we see how individuals whose lives were disrupted or torn apart by the events of World War II and the Holocaust retain intense memories of the food they enjoyed in happier times. (Hersh, 2011, p. 11)

In this way, *Recipes Remembered* bears much in common with *In Memory's Kitchen*. Both emphasize the way food was used as a way to survive the camps. Food memory was used as means of survival in two ways. First, it helped those in the camps to suppress their hunger pangs and focus on something other than the terrible situation around them. Second, it allowed them to focus on the hope that they might someday get to cook for/with their families once again and even pass on their recipes to their children.

Finally, just as *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* encourages the reader to "put their own spin" on the recipes in the cookbook, so too does *Recipes Remembered:*

> The best soup I ever tasted was at my grandmother's table, surrounded by family, being shushed by my father, and encouraged to misbehave by his. The soup might have been a little salty and the matzo balls sat like spheres of cardboard in my stomach, but I would have sworn that soup was perfection. Every recipe in this book represents someone's

> best, and there's a legion of loyal tasters who would swear to that. When you replicate a dish from this book, be faithful to the recipe, but be sure to include a piece of yourself in every preparation. Make it your own, make a food memory, make a new tradition and make it the best your family ever tasted. (Hersh, 2011, p. 13)

In this sense, both cookbooks ask the reader to begin to create their own food memories. By emphasizing these recipes (and putting one's own spin on them), Hersh is implicitly attaching food, food culture, and recipes to survival beyond the Holocaust. Again, here the focus of this Holocaust remembrance is not on loss of food culture, but on recreating it.

In the narratives themselves as well, this emphasis is clear. For example, Regina Schmidt Finer emphasizes food memory as a means of survival, "Through it all, there were so many memories of my childhood that helped me get through the difficult times. So many of my memories revolved around traditions and food" (Hersh, 2011, p. 28). She goes on to describe specific food memories and dishes that she remembers helping her mother make as a child. It was these food memories – and the hope that she would one day recreate them with her own child – that gave her the means to survive in the camps.

In the Poland section of *Recipes Remembered*, Hersh writes narratives for several of the Bielski partisans, a group of Jewish resistance fighters who survived by living and hiding in the woods, doing what they could to save other Jews stuck in ghettos or camps. In all of these stories, survival is a key theme. For example, Zvi Bielski, son of the founder of the Bielski partisans, says at the end of his narrative: "That was my family history. Resistance in the purest sense is what they did. Resistance takes many forms, as even today we are still defying the Nazis by retelling these stories" (Hersh, 2011, p. 35). This theme of resistance and survival is repeated

again and again by those in *Recipes Remembered* as a way to emphasize that the Holocaust was not just about overwhelming loss, but also about survival despite and in spite of that loss.

Hersh's *Recipes Remembered* had the highest degree of editorial control of all three cookbooks. By ensuring that resistance and survival remained themes throughout the cookbook, she effectively reframed Holocaust remembrance. Instead of mourning loss, the reader remembers the stories of those that survived and prepare their recipes as a means of honoring that survival and further defying the Nazis. Holocaust memory becomes reframed through hope and optimism, reminding the reader that by preparing these foods, they too ensure survival beyond the Holocaust.

Conclusion

In their emphasis on the relationship between food, memory, and survival, the narratives in these three cookbooks create a means to recreate what was lost during the Holocaust. By offering usable recipes and asking that when the reader serves this meal, they read the survivor's story and discuss, these cookbooks ask readers to reconstruct Jewish life, and especially Jewish food culture, in a world beyond the Holocaust. In this sense, the Holocaust cookbooks offer a means for not just constructing collective memory but also recreating Jewish food culture in the modern world.

During the Holocaust, food talk, or "cooking with the mouth" offered those in the camps a means of finding the will to continue living, to hope for a future beyond the camps. Outside of the camps, and decades beyond the Holocaust, these cookbooks are created in the interest of never forgetting, of continuing a Jewish culture at risk of being lost. The cookbooks, recipes side-by-side with memoirs, offer a site of collective memory, where the Jewish world pre-

Holocaust may not only be remembered but also reenacted by continuing to cook and share recipes.

For a younger generation of Jews who not only did not live through the war, but who do not have parents or grandparents who lived through it, these cookbooks offer a new Jewish communal identity. Through the two edited cookbooks, the past is not just made present, but reasserted into the modern world. Though the recipes are only fragments of the loss of a previous world, the fragments may be pulled through into the present to create a new Jewish collective memory and identity. The pearl may yet be uncovered.

However, memoirs alone are not sufficient. Despite the thousands of pages written by Holocaust survivors, Wieviorka, a prominent Holocaust historian, argues, "these memorial books have been neglected . . . they have not been transmitted, even though transmission was the objective their authors initially assigned to themselves" (Wieviorka, 2006, p. 28). If we understand "transmission" to mean never forgetting not only the Holocaust but also the culture, religion, society, and life of the Jews before the Holocaust, then Wieviorka is arguing that the function of remembering and continuing Jewish culture has not been accomplished through the form of memoirs. Younger generations of Jews, born after the Holocaust, no longer live as their grandparents or great-grandparents did: "The generations born after the destruction, after the Shoah, turn a blind eye to the world of their grandparents. As Jews without a heritage . . . they felt that Judaism had bequeathed them only the ashes of the crematoria" (Wieviorka, 2006, p. 28). These countless memoirs, Wieviorka argues, cannot fulfill the function of never forgetting.

For other Holocaust scholars, it is not enough to simply never forget. Marianne Hirsh argues that some scholars insist on keeping "'the wounds open' so as to warn against forgetting . . . to underscore the injunction 'Never again'" (Hirsch, 2012, p. 19). That is, it is not enough to

recall the Holocaust; to "never forget" one must also continue to feel the pain and loss of the Holocaust, in order to ensure that it never happens again. Wieviorka's criticism of memoirs applies here as well. It is in this context of memoirs failing to meet their original purpose that the choice to include not just a collection of memoirs, but a cookbook, speaks volumes.

References

Baron, S. (1937). *A Social and Religious History of the Jews*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

Beyond Our Walls: State Profiles on Holocaust Education. (n.d.). *United States Holocaust Memorial Museum*. United States Holocaust Memorial Council, Retrieved from https://www.ushmm.org/educators/teaching-about-the-holocaust/general-teaching-guidelines

Brenner, M. (2010). *Prophets of the past : interpreters of Jewish history*. Retrieved from http://ebookcentral.proquest.com

Brouwer, Daniel C., and Linda Diane Horwitz. (2015) The Cultural Politics of Progenic Auschwitz Tattoos: 157622, A-15510, 4559, … . *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, *101*(3), 534-58. Web.

Brown, E. (2000). "Turning All the Past to Pain": Current Trends in the Memorialization of the Holocaust. *The Torah U-Madda Journal*, *9*, 108-132. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/40914644

Caras, J. (2007). *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook: Collected from around the World*. Port St. Lucie, FL: Caras & Associates. Print.

Cole, T. (2000). *Selling the Holocaust: from Auschwitz to Schindler: how history is bought, packaged, and sold*. New York, NY: Routledge.

DeSilva, C, ed. (1996). *In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy from the Women of Terezin*. Northvale, NJ: J. Aronson. Print.

Engel, D. (2002, April 16). *On Studying Jewish History in Light of the Holocaust.* Lecture presented at Maurice R. And Corinne P. Greenberg Inaugural Lecture in United States

Holocaust Memorial Museum, Washington, D.C. Retrieved from https://www.ushmm.org/m/pdfs/20031204-engel.pdf

Guidelines for Teaching About the Holocaust. (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://www.ushmm.org/educators/teaching-about-the-holocaust/general-teaching-guidelines

Gutman, Y. and Shatzker, C. (1984). *The Holocaust and Its Significance.* Jerusalem: The Zalman Shazar Center. Print.

Hersh, J.F. (2011). *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival*. New York, NY: Museum of Jewish Heritage. Print.

Hirsch, M. (2012). *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture after the Holocaust*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press. Print.

Roskies, D. G. (1984). *Against the apocalypse: responses to catastrophe in modern Jewish culture*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.

Satlow, M. (2011, March 07). The End of Lachrymosity. Retrieved from http://msatlow.blogspot.com/2011/03/end-of-lachrymosity.html

Steinfels, P. (1989, November 26). Salo W. Baron, 94, Scholar of Jewish History, Dies. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/1989/11/26/obituaries/salo-w-baron-94-scholar-of-jewish-history-dies.html

The Libeskind Building. (n.d.). Retrieved from https://www.jmberlin.de/en/libeskind-building

Wieviorka, A. (2006). *The Era of the Witness*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. Print.

Chapter Three – "Cooking with the Mouth" or Crafting a New Jewish Food Culture

While memoirs can serve as evidence of an event, ensure that a tragedy is not forgotten, or (re)frame collective memory, they cannot recreate the past or teach those who have lost their roots how to reclaim them. Memoirs ensure that memory remains fixed on paper, unable to transcend beyond the page. Thus, cookbooks imbued with Holocaust memory offer a unique mechanism for bringing the past into the present and for fostering a new sense of Jewish identity. This chapter will explore how using cookbooks as a form of Holocaust memory can go beyond simply reframing the Holocaust. I will argue that these cookbooks, with their focus on the Holocaust, can do more than just transmit memory and culture across generations; they can recreate culture. Furthermore, this set of cookbooks and the Holocaust memory they invoke is unique in its ability to craft a more inclusive identity and culture fit for fourth generation, largely secular, American Jews, as the recipes are from across the world and are not strictly kosher. Thus, they can help to recreate a new sense of Jewish identity for fourth generation American Jews. Instead of merely recording or bearing witness to a traumatic past, these cookbooks are part of a creative, inventional process where new collective Jewish identifies are formed.

Cookbooks are a unique form in that they tap into long-standing Jewish food culture, while offering modifications on traditional Jewish foods. This chapter will begin by explaining Judaism and Jewish culture's relationship with food. Then, I will explain why cookbooks are uniquely able to preserve culture and why memory cookbooks can move beyond preservation into recreation. Third, I will analyze the recipes of the cookbooks, articulating why they are uniquely able to speak to a fourth generation of Jewish Americans. Finally, I will offer concluding thoughts and implications.

Judaism, Jews, and Food

Food has always played a central religious and cultural role in Jewish life. The Jewish calendar, Diner (2003) explains, "moved from holiday to holiday, from Sabbath to the six days of the work week, from one life cycle event to another, along a food trajectory" (Diner, p. 155). Every Jewish holiday and life event and most synagogue services are associated with food. Even outside of these events, Jews are constantly thinking about food as they plan meals while adhering to laws of keeping kosher.

From the very beginning of Judaism, food was given a sacred, religious role: "The purpose of eating and drinking is to give courage and strength to better serve God by using this energy to study, pray, and practice the teachings and lessons of the Torah" (Schwartz, 2008, p. xiii). Keeping kosher (following a set of dietary restrictions, such as restraining from consuming meat and dairy together or slaughtering only specific animals in a particular way, also called "kashrut"[7]) set Jews apart from their contemporaries and required them to think more thoroughly about food and food processes. For Jews who wish to keep kosher in modern times, save for those in mostly Jewish communities or living in Israel, it requires a great deal of planning and effort. For example, those that kept strict kosher in my hometown of Grand Rapids, Michigan had to plan to make frequent trips to Chicago or Detroit to visit kosher-only supermarkets and butchers.

For many Jews, keeping kosher became even more important after surviving the Holocaust. So much had been lost, but this one practice that tied them to a religion and their ethnic group could be maintained. For some, it was a way of making sense of chaos. Ellen

[7] Kashrut is the Hebrew word for kosher

Rosanski Wolf, who survived by escaping to Great Britain on the kindertransport program (and whose story is told in the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*), certainly felt this way:

> While her life was filled with strangers, she didn't speak their language, the locale was unfamiliar, and the national customs disparate. But she could take comfort in the predictability of the rituals of her religion, especially in the laws of kashrut. It was the food that became the connecting point for her. In a time of utter chaos and loss, the laws of Judaism were the rock upon which a new life was to be built. (Caras, 2007, p. 30)

On the podcast *The Sporkful,* host Dan Pashman interviews his mother-in-law about keeping kosher. She is the daughter of Holocaust survivors and continues to eat kosher because of the loss of the Holocaust. She explains that her mother lost seven siblings and both of her parents in the Holocaust and "clung to her faith without wavering" as a result, which included keeping a strictly kosher home. Alice continues to keep kosher as a result of this upbringing (Pashman, 2017).

Beyond the regular, everyday practice of keeping kosher, food was a central part of Shabbat (or the Sabbath, also called Shabbos). At sundown on Friday nights, Jews would welcome Shabbat with prayer, lighting candles, and sharing a family meal together. Though the foods served at this meal vary from family to family, region-to-region, and generation-to-generation, the coming together for a family meal to begin a day of rest and prayer remains the same. For practicing Jewish families, the Friday meal is a prominent part of familial life. In fact, most of Shabbat is taken up by food or thoughts of food:

> The Sabbath emerged as the most powerful sacred food experience for Jews. Every week they organized the seventh day, from Friday sundown until Saturday night, around what they could not do. They could not handle money, make fire, write, chop wood, sew, all

> defined as work. They also organized the day around what they did do. They lit candles to usher in the Sabbath. They listened to the reading of the Torah in the synagogue on Saturday morning . . . And they ate. (Diner, 2003, p. 156)

Shabbat memories were valorized in a Jewish child's mind. The meals on Shabbat, especially on Friday night, were often the most elaborate and rich meals eaten during the week. And, as a result, memories of Shabbat, food, and home became intertwined. Thus, it's no surprise that many of the survivors who submitted recipes talk about Shabbat in their narratives, as Shabbat was a reminder of home, of childhood, and of normal life before the war.

In the introduction to *Recipes Remembered*, Hersh discusses the difficulty in pinning down a definition of or explanation for "Jewish food." In her explanation, she mentions that for some survivors "Jewish food" is simply what they ate every Friday night: "for a Polish survivor it is the coveted Shabbos dinner with chopped liver, matzo ball soup and roast chicken" (Hersh, 2011, p. 13). Regina Schmidt Finer, in her narrative in *Recipes Remembered*, explains that her survival in the camps was linked to her memories of Shabbat dinners:

> there were so many memories of my childhood that helped me get through the difficult times. So many of my memories revolved around traditions and food. I remember how our family and neighbors would gather in my mother's home for Shabbos. It was a competition to see who was the biggest *baleboste*[8] – that was determined by who baked the best challah and made the best noodles for the *kugel*. (italics in original) (Hersh, 2011, p. 28)

Regina's contributed recipes are for her own homemade egg noodles, which she used as a base for kugel, pierogis, and kreplach. Similarly, The Kushner's family recipe included in the

[8] A *baleboste* is a homemaker. The glossary of *Recipes Remembered* offers this example: "if you make homemade noodles instead of opening a box, you are a real baleboste" (Hersh, 2011, p. 354).

cookbook is for "simplest whole roast chicken" because it is a staple for Friday night dinners: "Friday night dinner was and still is a time for the Kushner family to come together. It features time-honored food, none more universal for Shabbos dinner than roast chicken" (Hersh, 2011, p. 51). Henny Durmashkin Gurko also included a recipe for their Friday night "roasted chicken and vegetables," as they "ate chicken every Friday night" (Hersh, 2011, p. 82).

Even for many non-practicing Jews, Friday night is a time for traditional, familial foods because of its association with Shabbat. In her narrative in *Recipes Remembered*, Nadzia Goldstein Bergson explains, "even though we were not very observant, on Friday nights my mother would make the chicken soup and flanken" (Hersh, 2011, p. 56). Linda Amster, author of the *New York Times Jewish Cookbook*, writes "Foods shape our memories of home and childhood, and I am not sure I ever approach a Friday night without recalling, at least for a moment, the traditional Sabbath dinner – even though I often complained about it as a child" (Amster, 2003, p. xvii). Though I grew up in a very different time and place from Linda, my Jewish food memories also revolve around Shabbat dinners at my grandparent's house, where I spent almost every Friday night in middle school before going to synagogue with them in the morning.

Food was and still is also an essential part of most Jewish holidays. For some holidays, the food had a ritualistic relationship – such as eating challah and drinking wine every Shabbat, or eating cheesecake on Shavuot. Other holidays have a more symbolic relationship with food – such as dipping apples into honey on Rosh Hashanah to have a sweet New Year or eating fried latkes and doughnuts on Hanukkah to remember the oil that lasted for eight nights. On Purim, Jews eat hamantashen in the shape of Haman's 3-pointed hat. On Passover, the Seder plate in the center of the table is home to symbolic foods, such as salt water for the tears shed during the

exodus from Egypt and maror (bitter herbs) to represent the bitterness of slavery in Egypt. Passover is one of the most important holidays in the Jewish calendar and thus was a particularly difficult time for those imprisoned during World War II.

In the camps, some even tried to create a Passover Seder or refrain from eating bread. Bitka Goldberg recalls a girl who did the latter: "When Passover came, the girls didn't eat bread for seven days and instead only ate potatoes and beats. The kitchen of the camp gave the girls extra potatoes instead of bread during this time" (Caras, 2007, p. 167). Golda Goldberg Zerykier explains in the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* that she was sent to Auschwitz right before Passover and tried to hold a Seder in the camp:

> we decided to make a Seder & invite the whole staff, including the German head of the camp, 2 other German men and 2 women. We were about 50 people. We took some basic food from the kitchen, like vegetables and eggs. We made borsht, cooked potatoes, and set the table. It looked a little bit like home. I conducted the Seder, explained what it is about, and what was done to Jews at that time. Everybody listened with a serious expression on their faces. I made Kiddush. When I sat down I couldn't keep back the tears from covering my face. I washed and said the bracha [blessing]. Nobody moved. We finished at midnight. The next morning the Jewish Kapo came to me and said they took me off the list, but the other five girls were deported three days later! Another miracle!" (Caras, 2007, p. 8)

The recipes Golda contributes to the cookbook are both for cakes she would have cooked during Passover. Ellen Rosanski Wolf was still with her family for Passover in 1939, but would leave Germany on the kindertransport program days later. Her daughter-in-law, Jackie Katz, in the *Holocaust Survivor* Cookbook, explains how significant Passover was to her family:

> Food and the preparing of it remained very important to my mother-in-law. It is still her means of connecting. At every Seder, for each of her children, grandchildren, nieces and nephews there is that favorite dish that Ellen makes for him or her. And while there are many different dishes, this recipe for Matzoh Cake is a universal favorite. Dishes may come and go but the Matzoh cake is a staple. (Caras, 2007, p. 30)

Ellen's submission to the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* is the recipe for this Matzoh cake, which her daughter-in-law finds deeply symbolic:

> This simple recipe made the trip with Ellen from Germany. Like Ellen, it too survived.
>
> I believe that this cake is symbolic of the children on those trains. The matzoh in it represents the haste with which the children fled from Nazi Germany and the sweetness of the chocolate represents the childhood of which they were deprived.
>
> We serve this cake every Passover as our reminder. *Enjoy this at your Seder and never forget*. (Caras, 2007, p. 31 – italics in original)

Time and time again, survivors attempted to make sense of what was happening around them by clinging to their traditions and trying to recreate important food rituals during the Holocaust, despite the difficulty and danger in doing so.

As evidenced by the examples above, food was incredibly important to Jews imprisoned in the Nazi network of labor, concentration, and death camps. During the Holocaust, food talk became a mechanism for survival. In both the preface and the introduction of *In Memory's Kitchen*, there is an emphasis on how "food talk" was used as a mechanism for survival through the camps. This is mentioned in both *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered*; it was talking about food and remembering life before the war that gave those

trapped in ghettos and camps and in hiding the will to persevere. Unlike in the other two collections of recipes, however, *In Memory's Kitchen* focuses on this food talk.

Food talk was common in Terezin. Bianca Steiner Brown, a former inmate at Terezin and the translator of Mina's cookbook, recalls women not only actively reminiscing about their favorite foods but also having discussions, "even arguments, about the correct way to prepare dishes they might never be able to eat again" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxviii). It was in the bunks at night that Brown remembers women calling out to each other "do you know such and such a cake? . . . I did it in such and such a way" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxviii).

And food talk was not unique to Terezin. Susan E. Cernyak-Spatz, a survivor of Terezin and Auschwitz and professor emeritus at the University of North Carolina, says this "food talk" was so common in both camps that they had an expression for it: "cooking with the mouth." She explains, "Everybody did it. And people got very upset if they thought you made a dish the wrong way or had the wrong recipe for it" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxix). It is unsurprising, then, that this cookbook is not the only one of this sort that has been found. Two smaller manuscripts (one written entirely in Terezin, the other only partially written there) are in possession of Israel's Beit Theresienstadt, "the cultural center, library, and archive of Givat Chaim-Ichud, a kibbutz founded by survivors of the ghetto" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxix). At least three other recipe collections are housed at Yad Vashem. Undoubtedly, there are more. It is likely that as the holdings of Yad Vashem and other similar museums become digitized, more cookbooks or recipe collections will be found.

It is worth noting that the very existence of these cookbooks represents the commitment to food as culture, as paper was a rare commodity at most camps. Sabina Marguiles, an Auschwitz survivor, makes clear that "if we had had paper at Auschwitz, we would have written

recipes down there, too. And if we had been able to write them down, we would have had a cookbook of thousands of pages" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxix). Those who wanted to write their recipes down would rely on whatever means they had to do so. Thus, one of the cookbooks in Yad Vashem is written across a propaganda leaflet given out by the Third Reich. Even if a recipe could not be written down, food talk "strengthened their resolution to survive, if only because it made more vivid, not what they sought to escape from, but what they were resolved to return to" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxi). It was discussion of food that gave many the will to survive, to continue on in unimaginable conditions. It is important to consider why women (and sometimes men) felt the need to put the recipes onto paper, even knowing that they risked their lives in doing so.

It was common before the Holocaust for women of Eastern and Central European societies to create their own handwritten cookbooks and to pass these down to their children. Even my own grandmother, a generation removed from life in Eastern Europe, learned to create handwritten cookbooks of her recipes from her mother, who had left Romania just before World War I. She has tens of binders filled with recipes for all occasions and regularly sends me her hand-written recipes when I mention trying to recreate one of her dishes. Clearly, the cookbooks were written to preserve this tradition, hoping beyond all hope that life in the concentration camps would pass and they would return to their homes.

From this, it is clear how important food talk and cookbooks were for Jews trapped in concentration camps. It was food talk that not only helped to keep them alive but also allowed them to maintain their sense of self, their identity. To recall these recipes "in desperate circumstances is to reinforce a sense of self and to assist . . . in our struggle to preserve it" (De Silva, 1996, p. xxvi).

During nearly every life event – britot, bas mitzvahs, weddings, and shivas – and in nearly every circumstance – happiness and sadess, celebration and strife – Jews across time and place turn to food, food memories, and food traditions for comfort and to make sense of the world around them. Jayne Cohen, a popular Jewish cookbook author explains "the proper food keeps both body and soul healthy. The physical becomes the spiritual, as we approach G-d through eating, worshiping at this unique altar, the table" (Cohen, 2000, p. 22).

As a result, cookbooks became particularly important. Shabbat serves as an excellent example; across history, geography, and denomination, Jewish families welcomed Shabbat with a meal, attended Synagogue for Shabbat and then "return[ed] to their own homes for communal meals. Recipes handed down from generation to generation are in fact the blueprints for communal meals. As a supporter and preserver of oral tradition, written recipes became essential" (Feinberg and Crosetto, 2011, p. 149). This may in part explain why some in the concentration camps wanted to preserve their food culture by writing it down.

After the Holocaust, Jewish food culture persisted, despite the tremendous loss of Jewish life, scholarship, and culture. However, as survivors spread across the world, "Jewish food" changed. This is particularly evident when reading *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*. There are more traditional recipes that are regularly associated with Jews, such as brisket, chicken soup, kugel, and gefilte fish. However, there are also foods submitted by survivors that would not readily be associated with Jews, and would even be surprising. Examples include crab cake, meat loaf, quiche, asparagus tart, arroz con pollo, and gnocchi.

While there are certainly some foods that are more associated with Jews than others, "Jewish food" has long been a finicky thing to tack down. Jews have always lived all over the world. As a result, "Jews adopted local foodstuffs and adapted them to their own laws" (Diner,

2001, p. 148). Diner explains that even across Europe, "Jewish food" differed greatly. Romanian Jews cooked with spices that would be exotic to the Jews of Poland. Polish Jews preferred their Gefilte fish sweet, while Ukrainian and Lithuanian Jews ate a savory Gefilte fish. Despite differences in regional foods and flavors, European Jews all shared a love of food. Diner argues that "the vast bulk of east European Jewish narratives, regardless of the writer's sex, class, geography, and ideology, described food in exquisite detail, their words catching tastes, smells, and sights" (Diner, 2001, p. 153). More importantly, food was how Jews created community and identity. Diner explains:

> Home and community functioned as overlapping spaced. The housewife in her kitchen and the community leaders in their formal bodies created community through food. Because Jewish communities and Judaism invested so much importance in what got eaten, they venerated food. People brought up in this world constantly talked about and wrote about food as a marker of identity. (Diner, 2001, p. 153)

Josh Ozersky, James Beard Award-winning food writer, argues that this is still true of American Jews today: "Jews are obsessed with food. We talk about it, we think about it, we compare notes about it; sometimes we even dream about it. You put two Jews together anywhere in American and five minutes later they're talking about chicken" (Ozersky, 2011, para. 3).

However, when Jews migrated to the United States after the war, food took on yet another important, more social role. These new American Jews were less religiously observant but still clung to ways to strengthen their Jewish cultural identity. This elevated and expanded the role of the deli as a place where Jews of different denominations, beliefs, and origins, could come together to eat Jewish food. Especially in New York City, the Jewish deli, in both kosher and nonkosher variants, "was a second home for many American Jews, especially those who

were the children of immigrants, who had begun to define their Jewish identity in a secular rather than religious fashion" (Merwin, 2015, p. 3).

Dan Merwin, author of *Pastrami on Rye: An Overstuffed History of the Jewish Deli*, argues that for immigrant Jews living in America (and their children) delis played a more important social role in Jewish life than the synagogue. Merwin argues that this is because the deli essentially took on the symbolic role of homeland:

> Before the establishment of the State of Israel, before even the dispersion of Jews across the North American continent, the cramped, bustling delicatessen became a focal point of Jewish identity and remembrance – a capacious, well-trodden, metaphorical homeland for the Jewish soul. . . . The delicatessen became an all-purpose symbol of Jewishness. As a delighted customer once exhaled upon entering the Second Avenue Del, 'Ah, I smell Judaism!' (Merwin, 2015, p. 3)

The Jewish deli was Judaism at this time, and, as a result, strengthened the relationship between Jewish identity, life, and culture and food. For less observant or non-practicing Jews, going to the deli and eating Jewish food was how they practiced their Judaism. Merwin explains this when he describes his own family's relationship to the Jewish deli:

> My parents had no formal connections to the Jewish community. They didn't belong to a synagogue, didn't celebrate the High Holy Days, and didn't send me to Hebrew School. But on Sunday nights . . . my mother would dispatch me . . . to a kosher-style deli . . . I was delegated to pick up an unvarying order: a pound of roast beef, a pound of turkey, a dozen slices of rye bread studded with caraway seeds, a can of vegetarian baked beans, and a . . . take-out container of gravy. We made our own sandwiches around the round,

wooden kitchen table. When we took the first bite of deli, our Jewishness came in like the tide." (Merwin, 2015, p. xii)

Merwin argues that this is an example of how second and third generation Jews felt at the time: though they may not have been practicing or observant by going to synagogue or Hebrew school or keeping kosher, delis – and Jewish food and eating more broadly – allowed them to have a sense of Jewish identity.

Delis were particularly important for second generation Jews: "the delicatessen enabled second-generation Jews to refuel themselves and reinvigorate their own tradition, at the same time as it facilitated their entrance into the mainstream of American society" (Merwin, 2015, p. 3). Jewish delis allowed second generation Jews to maintain and strengthen their Jewish identities and traditions while also providing space to adapt these to the American culture they were surrounded by.

Unfortunately, the cultural and social role of the Jewish deli has been greatly diminished for fourth generation Jews. When Merwin published his book in 2015, Jewish delis in New York had seen a 99% drop since the 1930s; only fifteen Jewish delis remained open in the five boroughs (Merwin, 2015, p. 167). Jewish delis have faced a similar fate in suburban areas as well: "five kosher delis – two of which dated back to the 1950s – have closed on Long Island in the past eighteen months, as fewer non-Orthodox Jews keep kosher and as deli food continues to give way to other, more multicultural alternatives" (Merwin, 2015, p. 167).

As a result, many formerly kosher delis have expanded what they sell. Now, alongside a pastrami sandwich, many also sell sushi, hamburgers, Chinese food, or Israeli food. In this sense, Merwin argues that the deli represents the idea of a "postethnic" identity, "in which cultural affiliation is no longer a matter of genealogical descent but instead a matter of consent – or, one

could say, choice" (Merwin, 2015, p. 169). The deli, then, is "postcommunal," in that it is still a symbol of Jewish culture but no longer serves the social function it once did. The Jewish deli is now nostalgic, a *lieux de memoire* or a place of memory. In the words of Pierre Nora, the prominent scholar of memory studies (and himself a Holocaust survivor), "they mark the rituals of a society without ritual" (Nora, 1996, p. 12). However, despite the diminishing role of Jewish delis (and Jewish foods writ large as Jews increasingly become secular), cookbooks can still play a large role in Jewish life. In this next section, I begin to explain the role of cookbooks, paying particular attention to how they can function as constitutive rhetoric.

Cookbooks (and Their Ability to Constitute Subjects)

Though academics have begun to take food, food cultures, and foodways more seriously as worthy of academic study, cookbooks are still a relatively new area of investigation. Several have taken up the task of analyzing cookbooks, especially in the fields of history and anthropology. For example, Anne Willian and Mark Cherniavsky examine four hundred recipes from medieval times to present, explaining how cookbooks and recipes reflect the time and culture they come out of (Willian and Cherniavsky, 2012). Janet Theophano argues that through reading of women's cookbooks from the 17th century all the way through the 1950s, scholars can come to understand women's lives. Further, she argues that women used these cookbooks to assert their individuality and develop their minds (Theophano, 2003). Janet Floyd and Laurel Forster, in their edited volume *The Recipe Reader*, argue that the recipe is a quintessential embodiment of lifestyle choices and an important form of cultural expression (Floyd and Forster, 2003).

However, few have offered a rhetorical analysis of a set of cookbooks. And yet, cookbooks are undoubtedly rhetorical. Elisabeth Luard, an award-winning food-writer, argues

that food guides us "along the paths of ancestral memory" (Luard, 2001, p. 54). Nowhere is this more clearly true than with cookbooks, which offer literal instructions for preserving culture and history; for many, particularly diasporic communities, cookbooks are guides to the group's history since "As generations ensue, younger children are left with these recipes and cookbooks" (Feinberg & Crosetto, 2011, p. 150).

Cookbooks are often spoken of in terms of "preserving" culture and identity. This is largely because food is enormously important in an ethnic groups' collective identity. Often, childhood food memories shape an adult's cultural identity. The examples in the previous section on the various ways of keeping kosher, Shabbat, and Jewish holidays that were remembered in the camps or by survivors are demonstrative of this.

Several scholars have identified the ways cookbooks are used in an effort to preserve Jewish culture. Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblet (1987) argues that early Jewish cookbooks were "manuals for the preparation of Anglo-Jewish cuisine and invaluable resources for social historians that mirror society's customs of the time as well as demonstrate the compatibility of Jewish ritual with non-Jewish societal norms of the times" (Feinberg and Crosetto, 2011, p. 152). Jewish cookbooks not only offered blueprints for creating Jewish food, but also contained instructions for maintaining Jewish food cultures, often giving advice or instructions for how to keep a kosher kitchen or maintain a household. Cookbooks tell historians not just about food cultures, but also how Jews were adapting to social norms of where and when they lived as well. In a later article, Kirshenblatt-Gimblett (1990) analyzes another set of nineteenth century Jewish cookbooks in the U.S. to understand how Jews adapted. The cookbooks allow her to understand how Jews dealt with pressures to stop keeping kosher or how they sought to Americanize their food.

Alice Nakhimovsky analyzes post-Soviet era Jewish cookbooks to document how Russian Jews changed and reclaimed Jewish culinary practices. Nakhimosky argues that these cookbooks point to the difficulties in wanting to maintain Jewish practices in a changing world. She contends that the cookbooks demonstrate how Russian Jews attempted to "connect to their Jewish ancestry," even though the books have a decreased emphasis on keeping kosher, lack recipes traditionally passed down from previous generations, and continue use of non-Jewish names of recipes for clearly Jewish foods (Nakhimovsky, 2006).

Cookbooks have also been identified as important for identity and memory. Carol Bardenstein (2002) argues that "food provides a unique operation of memory and collective identity" and that a cookbook's ability to "transmit and preserve memoirs" is particularly important for "those relocated individuals whose ability to maintain a cultural identity is challenged in the immigration progress" (Feinberg and Crosetto, 2011, p. 152). Similarly, Rosalyn Collings Eves (2005) contends that cookbooks decode tradition and preserve communal identity by passing down knowledge and instructions to future generations.

Eves (2005) calls cookbooks "memory texts." They have the unique ability to transmit memory, to preserve culture and offer instructions for the next generation. Transmitting food culture is particularly important, as food culture is often "one of the most distinctive expressions of an ethnic group, or, in modern times, a nation. Frequently, the last sign of an individual's attachment to his roots before total assimilation into the host community is the consumption of distinctive kinds of foods" (De Silva, 2005, p. 112). As a result, cookbooks, or literal guides to cooking specific types of foods and recipes, can preserve culture and identity in that they explain what is distinct about a particular ethnic group.

This is particularly important in the Jewish context, as sometimes, in the wake of the Holocaust, all that some families had left were recipes. One such example is the narrative of the Jacobs family shared in *Recipes Remembered*:

> In my father's family, there are barely any family heirlooms to pass down. Everything they had was either taken, lost or stolen. That is why this recipe is so precious and so dear to me. It's really a family treasure . . . Every time I bake I am really honoring my wonderful father, my aunt Rose, my grandmother, as well as my grandfather, aunts, and uncles who died in the war. I love to bake and baking is a way of preserving their memory. (Hersh, 2011, p. 93)

The recipes included for this narrative are for "baba's dough" and "baba's cheesecake." This highlights many of the important aspects of cookbooks. First, it reinforces Bardenstein's argument – for diaspora communities, food is one the last and strongest ways in which they can connect and identify with their homeland. Though that "homeland" might be more diffuse for Jewish families that survived the Holocaust, the longing for the home, and attempt to connect with that home through food, remains the same. Second, it emphasizes how important cookbooks and recipes may be for Jewish families, particularly in the wake of the loss of the Holocaust. Not only were two-thirds of European Jews lost, but also the cultural and religious center of Judaism was destroyed. In the wake of this, reconnecting with Jewish foods and recreating the foods made by those who survived is not only a powerful way to remember the Holocaust, but also to re-establish Jewish culture after the Holocaust. Joan Nathan, a prominent Jewish cook and author, made this case for her own cookbooks, arguing, "assimilated second-generation Americans can use her cookbooks to return to their Jewish roots in order to 'understand the old tastes'" (Nathan, 1998, p. 27 qtd. in Feinberg and Crosetto, 2011, p. 150). In the next section, I

will argue that *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* offer the same chance to fourth generation American Jews. Bardenstein and Nathan make clear that cookbooks can help to transmit cultural information to future generations. I argue that they can do more, they can help to not only recreate past Jewish food culture in the present, but also (re)create Jewish identity. The cookbooks are able to do this, I argue, by functioning as constitutive rhetoric.

Althusser argues that a key process in the production and formation of ideology is the "constitution of the subject, where the subject is precisely he or she who simultaneously speaks and initiates action in discourse (a subject to a verb) and in the world (a speaker and social agent)" (Althusser, as qtd. in Charland, 1987, p. 133). This subject can be "hailed" or called into being through constitutive rhetoric. Althusser calls this process "interpellation:"

> I shall then suggest that ideology 'acts' or 'functions' in such a way that it 'recruits' subjects among the individuals (it recruits them all) or 'transforms' the individuals into subjects (it transforms them all) by that very precise operation which I have called *interpellation* or hailing, and which can be imagined along the lines of the most commonplace everyday police (or other) hailing: 'hey, you there!' (Althusser, 1971, p. 170)

Constitutive rhetoric doesn't just call an audience into being, but an identity. Importantly, Charland notes that this process of identification works by rhetorical narratives assuming that their subjects are "always already" constituted: "From this perspective, a subject is not 'persuaded' to support sovereignty. Support for sovereignty is inherent to the subject position addressed by *souverainiste* (pro-sovereignty) rhetoric" (Charland, 1987, p. 134). As a result,

Burke notes that this identification process can occur "spontaneously, intuitively, even consciously" (Burke, 1966, p. 301).

The Holocaust cookbooks act as constitutive rhetoric in that they call into being the Jewish identity of fourth generation Jewish Americans. This identity "always already" existed, but perhaps was not thought of as identity. The cookbooks, by creating a new Jewish narrative that pulls the Holocaust back into the larger narrative of Jewish history and reframing Holocaust remembrance through a more optimistic, hopeful lens (as discussed in Chapter Two), call into being a stronger Jewish identity for fourth generation American Jews. The cookbooks act as a means to constitute this new identity. In this next section, I will provide a deeper analysis of the recipes and foods found within these cookbooks, explaining how they act as constitutive rhetoric and the new identity they call into being.

Reading Holocaust Cookbooks as a Fourth Generation Jew

To understand what these cookbooks may mean for fourth generation Jews, it is necessary to first paint a picture of what these fourth generation American Jews are like. Today's Jews live in an increasingly secular world. Jews are still overwhelmingly proud to call themselves Jewish and feel a strong sense of belonging to Jewish people. However, fewer Jews than ever before are practicing or observant religious Jews. According to a 2013 Pew Research Center study, 22% – or 1 in 5 Jews – identify themselves as "having no religion" (Pew Research Center, 2013). Furthermore, fewer American adults than ever before identify themselves as Jewish at all: "The percentage of U.S. adults who say they are Jewish when asked about their religion has declined by about half since the late 1950s and currently is a little less than 2%" (Pew Research Center, 2013, para. 2). This shift becomes even more obvious when the data is presented by generation: 93% of first generation American Jews identify themselves as Jewish

on the basis of religion, only 7% describe themselves as "having no religion." In contrast, among fourth generation Jews, 68% identify themselves as Jews by religion, while 31% describe themselves as having no religion and identify as Jews on the basis of "ancestry, ethnicity, or culture" (Pew Research Center, 2013). Jews are not only increasingly becoming more secular and less religious, but they also increasingly feel that being Jewish does not require religion:

> 62% say being Jewish is mainly a matter of ancestry and culture, while just 15% say it is mainly a matter of religion. Even among Jews by religion, more than half (55%) say being Jewish is mainly a matter of ancestry and culture, and two-thirds say it is not necessary to believe in God to be Jewish. (Pew Research Center, 2013)

This data is reflective of broader American trends towards increased secularization. As intermarriages continue to increase, it is likely that this trend will only accelerate, as Pew finds that "Jews of no religion" are more likely to marry non-Jewish spouses and raise their children to not be Jewish.

As both a symptom and a result of this decline, Jewish food has also seen a decline. Josh Ozersky argued that Jewish food is near extinction, explaining, "Jewish food comes out of two things – theology and poverty, neither of which impinges on most Jews nowadays, who are secular to the bone" (Ozersky, qtd. in Merwin, 2015, p. 173). Other prominent writers on Jewish food have argued that Jewish food is declining because it is bland and uninteresting. Joan Nathan has written that Ashkenazi foods "traveled so far they had lost much of their flavor" (Nathan, 2010, para. 5). Alan Richman, a James Beard Award-winning food journalist for GQ, argues, "cuisines tend to be from a place, and Jews never had a place. Through the millennia, they got pushed from place to place, and everywhere they went their food changed. When I was a kid, Jewish food tasted different in every home I visited" (Richman, 2013, para. 1). No one knows

what these foods are "supposed" to taste like, Richman argues (Richman, 2013, para. 1). Perhaps this is also why it is so tricky to even determine what "Jewish food" is, since Jews have been so adept at adapting their own food traditions to the places they live.

Despite the decline of religious Jews and pathways to Jewish identity, 94% of American Jews say they are proud to be Jewish. When asked what it means to be Jewish, Pew found that most Jews (73%) say that "remembering the Holocaust" is what being Jewish means to them (Pew Research Center, 2013). Interestingly, this reflects what Pierre Nora argued in 1996: that "to be Jewish is to remember being Jewish" (Nora, 1996, p. 11). So, Jews are becoming increasingly less religious but still think that being Jewish is important and are proud to be Jewish. Being Jewish for many current American Jews is also bound up in remembering the Holocaust. And, at the same time, Jewish food, foodways, and food cultures are declining. Or, at least, there is no modern-day equivalent of the Jewish deli. By this I mean, there is no central social or cultural center for young, Jewish Americans.

It is in this light that I argue these cookbooks offer a unique way for fourth generation American Jews to find a stronger Jewish identity, acting as constitutive rhetoric to call their Jewish identities into being. *In Memory's Kitchen*, *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* are unique in their ability to both remember and reframe the Holocaust *and* Jewish food culture. They bring together a long tradition of Jewish food culture while reframing the way the Holocaust is remembered. Like other Jewish cookbooks, they provide recipes meant to ensure Jewish food traditions are preserved across generations. However, these cookbooks are also a new form of Holocaust memory, one that weaves memory of the Holocaust back into Jewish history, culture, and life. Instead of dwelling on the loss of the Holocaust, these

cookbooks call for young Jews to recreate Jewish cultural life by making the foods of Jews from all around the world; it creates a new narrative of Jewish identity.

These cookbooks make this call (and act as constitutive rhetoric) in a few different ways. First, the cookbooks are nuanced when it comes to their expectations about keeping kosher. While *The Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* are both kosher cookbooks, they do not encourage or suggest that the reader/user of the cookbooks also keep kosher. The *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* is kosher in the sense that it does not violate the laws of kosher – it marks recipes as meat, dairy, or parve[9] – but there is no explicit commentary on keeping kosher or maintaining the "kosher-ness" of the recipes. In fact, instead, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* encourages readers to make each recipe their own: "Try them, accept them as they are, modify them, or use them as a starting point to let your imagination go. Remember the history that they contain" (Caras, 2007, "How to Use This Cookbook").

The cookbook reader/user need not make the exact recipe or keep the recipe kosher in order to re-create the Jewish food or even to engage in Holocaust remembrance. Instead, all that is required, according to the cookbook, is to use the recipe as a base or inspiration and share the story attached to the recipe when you serve it, so that whoever you serve it to may also take part in the remembrance.

Recipes Remembered does explicitly call itself a kosher cookbook. In a section called "Navigating the Book," Hersh first offers a brief paragraph on how recipes are organized within each chapter. Immediately following this is a small paragraph called "kosher," where Hersh explains:

[9] Parve is Yiddish for "neutral;" it is a food with neither dairy nor meat products

> Time for true confessions, I am not kosher. When I first considered the framework for this book I debated many things, but one that was non-negotiable was the book needed to be kosher. I felt that out of respect for those who were contributing recipes and especially to honor those who were not here to do so, the book would be kosher. (Hersh, 2011, p. 15)

Though Hersh thinks that it is important for the cookbook itself to be kosher as a way to honor both Jewish survivors and those who did not survive, she explains that she herself does not keep kosher. And, like the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook, Recipes Remembered* also makes clear that making a recipe need not be exact: "When you replicate a dish from this book, be faithful to the recipe, but be sure to include a piece of yourself in every preparation. Make it your own, make a food memory, make a new tradition and make it the best your family has ever taste" (Hersh, 2011, p. 13). To end the introduction to the cookbook, Hersh says

> I spent hundreds of hours listening, learning, laughing, and crying. I heard incredible stories of defiance, resolve, bravery, and luck. I came home with recipes to test, savor, share and enjoy. The survivor community has so much to teach and we still have so much to learn. Devour their words and savor their message. (Hersh, 2011, p. 14)

From these two passages, it is clear that one need not hold steadfast to the kosher-ness of a recipe being used. Rather, as long as readers preserve the basic recipe itself in their cooking and think about the narrative provided with the recipe, the reader will have done what is asked of them. Again, the emphasis is not on a perfect recreation but on cooking and sharing a food from a survivor alongside that survivor's story and message.

This is ideal for fourth generation American Jews. Not only do many of them not keep kosher, but it is also likely their third-generation parents did not either. As a result, fourth

generation Jews likely never even made the decision to *not* keep kosher, it was just never something they thought about to begin with because they were not brought up in a kosher household. By centering the cookbooks on the Holocaust remembrance aspect of the book and not needing a perfect replication of each Jewish food, the cookbooks allow millennial Jews to do what they already think is important about being Jewish – remember the Holocaust – with an attempt to re-establish a Jewish food culture, without forcing them to deal with the pressures and regulations of kosher cooking. While those who do keep strict kosher can use both of these cookbooks, they can just as easily be used and adapted by secular Jews who do not.

Second, the cookbooks make clear that Jewish food is not just your grandma's too salty chicken soup and brisket. Rather, Jewish food is more expansive. In *Recipes Remembered,* the recipes are organized by country. Separate chapters mark recipes from Poland, Austria and Germany, Belgium and France, Hungary and Czechoslovakia, Romania, Russia and the Ukraine, and Greece. At the beginning of each chapter, there is a page-long explanation of what food and food culture was like in that country/region before the war. For example, in the introduction to the Poland section, Hersh writes: "Like stone soup, Polish cuisine is a creative mix of available, affordable ingredients. A little of this and a bit of that, lovingly tossed together to make a nourishing, satisfying meal. If it grew in the ground and you could pickle, salt, or preserve it, even better" (Hersh, 2011, p. 26). In the introduction to Germany and Austria, Hersh explains "The food of Germany and Austria has always been influenced by its geographic location. The result is a flavorful blending of both Western and Eastern European cuisine. French influences are especially felt in southwestern Germany" (Hersh, 2011, p. 172).

By organizing the recipes in this way, Hersh places an emphasis on food (instead of narratives and survivors) and recreating Jewish food cultures. Since they are organized

regionally, readers of this cookbook can pick and choose recipes to recreate based on where their own particular families are from. In this sense, readers are able to more precisely recreate Jewish food culture. *Recipes Remembered* is an instruction manual for recreating Jewish foods by the area where the reader's family is from.

However, *Recipes Remembered* still includes a huge variety and diversity in foods that are labeled as "Jewish" foods. In the chapter of Polish recipes, foods that are traditionally seen as Jewish are included, such as chicken soup, brisket, corned beef, challah, and kugel. However, it also includes recipes for various desserts, like chocolate chip cake, plum cake, citrus rice pudding, and honey cake. In the section about Germany and Austria, there are traditionally German recipes, such as streuselkuchen (crumb cake), palatschinken (thin pancakes), and Wiener Schnitzel (breaded veal cutlets). However, this chapter also includes Arroz con Pollo (chicken with rice) and Fried Platanos (plantains). These are both recipes learned and submitted by survivors who grew up in Germany but migrated to Latin America after WWII and thus began to adapt Jewish cooking, ingredients, and recipes to more traditionally Latin American dishes.

The *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* organizes recipes both by survivor and by type (breads, soups, kugels, main dishes, etc.). In this way, there is no specific commitment to recreating food in any regionally specific way. However, the recipes are just as diverse as the recipes in *Recipes Remembered*. There are traditional Jewish recipes for challah, kugel, brisket, matzo balls, rugelach and Shabbat chicken meals. However, there are also recipes for meat loaf, creamed spinach, Chinese cookies, and sugar cookies. Many of these recipes, since they are submitted by survivors and left unaltered, have names like "Henna Master's Famous Cookies," "Henny Levenberg's (Bubby's) Famous Mandel Bread," and "Grandma Rosie's Cookies." This emphasizes the recreation of Jewish food culture as well and the passing down of recipes through

generations to maintain recipes created by those who survived the war or remember food culture from prior to WWII.

Finally, by wedding together Jewish recipes with Holocaust remembrance, the cookbooks are uniquely situated to be used by fourth generation American Jews to reinforce and recreate Jewish identity and cultural attachment, in a way that memoirs or a Jewish cookbook alone are unable to do. Memoirs, as discussed in Chapter Two, are unable to create Jewish identity because 1) they have failed to transmit cultural information across generations and 2) they cannot adapt to the specific needs of fourth generation Jews (Wieviorka, 2006). Cookbooks alone cannot speak to Jewish identity as well as this set of Holocaust cookbooks because of the fourth generation attachment to Holocaust remembrance as "what it means to be Jewish." This set of Holocaust cookbooks, however, that weds Holocaust narrative with Jewish foods *can* act as constitutive rhetoric, in that it creates a new narrative for fourth generation American Jews. Though the deli may no longer be the center of Jewish social life in the United States, the kitchen and dining room table still can be. These cookbooks are a call to start cooking and remembering Jewish foods again. In this way, fourth generation American Jews are able to answer the call of Mina and the other women who first decided to write down recipes while imprisoned in Terezin:

> By the time they scrawled these recipes, such dishes were dreams. But to write them down was to insist on a real-world future, to insist that their daughters would receive their inheritance. The manuscript they labeled simply "Kochbuch" was a powerful symbol of their resistance to annihilation. (Shapiro, 1996, para. 12)

By making these recipes and reading the narratives of survivors, fourth generation American Jews can ensure that Mina's resistance is not futile or forgotten.

Conclusion

As mentioned above, "Jewish food" is notoriously tricky to define. Jews have lived across the globe for centuries. And, because Jews were often re-settling in new places, their foods changed substantially across time as they settled in each new place. In the U.S., classic "Jewish foods" are increasingly becoming assimilated into American food culture, losing their association with Judaism. Merwin reminds us that delis are increasingly non-Jewish and now serve things like sushi or Chinese food alongside classic pastrami sandwiches on rye. Bagels are now a popularized American breakfast food that can be found in supermarkets everywhere and are subject to becoming part of food trends, like the rainbow bagel craze of 2016.

This set of Holocaust cookbooks does not make the parameters of Jewish food any clearer. Instead, they highlight the wide variety of foods that Jews cooked and ate regularly both before the Holocaust and after migrating somewhere new after WWII. What makes these cookbooks unique, then, is not that they provide a strict instruction manual for eating Jewish food, but rather that they blend a re-creation of Jewish food culture with remembering the Holocaust.

Eves suggests that cookbooks "function rhetorically as memory texts: to memorialize both individuals and communities. . . and to generate a sense of collective memory that in turn shapes communal identity" (Eves, 2005, p. 281). That is precisely what is at work in these cookbooks. However, instead of memorializing those that were lost in the Holocaust, it celebrates those that survived. By emphasizing survival, and offering recipes that can be used to continue Jewish food culture, these memory texts create a potential new collective identity for secular, fourth generation American Jews. Perhaps what is learned in this is that "Jewish food" is

actually much less about the actual food and much more about coming together with other people to remember and, more importantly, to celebrate survival.

References

A Portrait of Jewish Americans. (2013, September 30). Pew Research Center: Religion & Public Life. Retrieved from http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey/

Althusser, L. (1971). *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, trans. Ben Brewster. New York, NY: Monthly Review Press.

Amster, L. ed. (2003). *The New York Times Jewish Cookbook*. New York, NY: St. Martin's press.

Bardenstein, C. (2002). The Gender of Nostalgia *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 28*,1. 353-87

Burke, K. (1966). *Language as Symbolic Action: Essays on Life, Literature, and Method*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Caras, J. (2007). *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook: Collected from around the World*. Port St. Lucie, FL: Caras & Associates. Print.

Charland, M. (1987). Constitutive rhetoric: The case of the peuple québécois. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, *73*(2), 133-150. doi:10.1080/00335638709383799

Cohen, J. (2000). *The Gefilte Variations: 200 Inspired Re-creations of Classics from the Jewish Kitchen, with Menus, Stories, and Traditions for the Holidays and Year-round.* New York, NY: Scribner.

De Silva, C, ed. (1996). *In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy from the Women of Terezin*. Northvale, NJ: J. Aronson. Print.

De Silva, C. (2005). In Memory's Kitchen: Reflections of a Recently Discovered Form of Holocaust Literature. In Greenspon, L.J., Simpkins, R.A., & Shapiro, G. (Eds.), *Food & Judaism* (105-117). Omaha, NE: Creighton University Press.

Diner, H. R. (2003). *Hungering for America: Italian, Irish, and Jewish foodways in the age of migration*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Eves, R.C. (2005). A Recipe for Remembrance: Memory and Identity in African American Women's Cookbooks. *Rhetoric Review*, *24*(3), 280-297

Feinberg, D. E., & Crosetto, A. (2011). Cookbooks: Preserving Jewish Tradition. *Judaica Librarianship*, *16*(1), 149-172. doi:10.14263/2330-2976.1010

Floyd, J., & Forster, L. (2010). *The recipe reader: narratives, contexts, traditions*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

Hersh, J.F. (2011). *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival*. New York, NY: Museum of Jewish Heritage. Print.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, B. (1987). The Kosher Gourmet in the Nineteenth Century Kitchen. *The Journal of Gastronomy*, *2*(4), 51-89.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, B. (1990). Kitchen Judaism. In Braunstein, D.L. & Joselit, J.W. (Eds.), *Getting Comfortable in New York: The American Jewish Home, 1880-1950* (77-105). New York, NY: The Jewish Museum.

Luard, E. (2001). *Sacred Food: Cooking for Spiritual Nourishment.* Chicago, IL: M.Q. Publications Limited.

Merwin, T. (2015). *Pastrami Rye: An Overstuffed History of the Jewish Deli*. New York, NY: New York University Press.

Nakhimovsky, A. (2006). You Are What They Ate: Russian Jews Reclaim Their Foodways. *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish* Studies, *25*(1), 63-77.

Nathan, J. (1998). *Jewish Cooking in America.* New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.

Nathan, J. (2004, March 31). Family Treasures Hold Kosher America's Roots. *The New York Times* Retrieved from: http://www.nytimes.com/2004/03/31/dining/family-treasures-hold-kosher-america-s-roots.html

Nora, P (1996). Between Memory and History. In Kritman, L. D. (Ed.), *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

Ozersky, J. (2011, April 28). The Kugel Conundrum. *Time Magazine.* Retrieved from http://content.time.com/time/nation/article/0,8599,2067923,00.html

Ozersky, J. (2012, October). Panel Discussion at the New York City Wine and Food Festival, New York City, New York.

Pashman, D. (Host). (2017, August 10). *Your Mom's Food Pt. 4: Til Pork Do Us Part* [Audio podcast]. Retrieved from http://www.sporkful.com/your-moms-food-pt-4-til-pork-do-us-part/

Richman, A. (2013, December 02). Alan Richman Walks Into a Jewish Deli... *Gentleman's Quarterly.* Retrieved from https://www.gq.com/story/alan-richman-walks-into-a-jewish-deli-in-new-york

Schwartz, Arthur (2008). *Arthur Schwartz's Jewish Home Cooking: Yiddish Recipes Revisted.* Berkeley, CA: Ten Speeds Press.

Shapiro, L. (1996, September 25). Holocaust Recipes: The Food Of Hope. *Sun-Sentinel.* Retrieved from http://articles.sun-sentinel.com/1996-09-25/lifestyle/9609230249_1_cookbook-terezin-holocaust-recipes

Theophano, J. (2003). *Eat My Words: Reading Women's Lives Through the Cookbooks They Wrote*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Griffin.

Wieviorka, A. (2006). *The Era of the Witness*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. Print.

Willan, A., & Cherniavsky, M. (2012). *The cookbook library four centuries of the cooks, writers, and recipes that made the modern cookbook*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Chapter Four – Conclusion: New Memory for a New Generation

"We cannot change what happened. That is the tragic part.
But we can change how we relate to it."
– Eva Mozes Kor, Auschwitz survivor

In May 1944, Eva and her twin sister Miriam arrived at Auschwitz with their parents and two older siblings. Within thirty minutes of their arrival, Eva and Miriam became the only surviving members of their family. They survived this initial arrival only because they were twins. For the next approximately nine months, until the camp was liberated in January 1945, Eva and her twin were a set of Mengele's twins, brutally tortured and experimented on. In a viral video where Eva tells her life story, she only spends about one-fourth of the video describing this episode. What makes Eva's story extraordinarily remarkable is not that she survived being a Mengele twin, but that decades later, she forgave Dr. Mengele.

In late 1993, Eva was invited by a professor in Boston to come and share her story. The professor also asked Eva if she could bring a Nazi doctor with her. Though stunned by the question, she reached out to a Nazi doctor from Auschwitz who had been interviewed for a German documentary that she and her twin had also been interviewed for. He would not go to Boston with her, but he did invite Eva to his home in Germany. She agreed. Not knowing what to expect, Eva found herself asking Dr. Munch (the Nazi doctor) if he ever walked by a gas chamber in Auschwitz, if he ever went inside a gas chamber, and if he knew how the gas chamber operated. Not only was Dr. Munch able to answer "yes" to all of these questions, but he also revealed to Eva that he had been responsible for signing a single death certificate after each use of a gas chamber in Auschwitz.

In 1995, Eva and Dr. Munch met again at Auschwitz to observe the 50th anniversary of the liberation of the camp. There, at the ruins of the gas chamber, Dr. Munch signed a document

testifying to the existence and use of gas chambers at Auschwitz. Eva proudly shows this document in the video, proclaiming, "I will have an original document, signed by a Nazi, and if I ever met a revisionist who said the Holocaust didn't happen, I could take that document and shove it in their face" (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017).

Eva wanted to thank the doctor for his willingness to write and sign this document. And so, she decided to write him a letter of forgiveness. In the process of writing this letter, she realized that she had "the power to forgive" even Dr. Mengele. This was cathartic for Eva, as it made her realize that she even had "power over the Angel of death of Auschwitz" (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017). When Dr. Munch and Eva met at Auschwitz to sign and exchange their document and letter, Eva describes feeling free, "free from Auschwitz, free from Mengele" (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017).

As a result of this forgiveness, Eva is often denounced by other survivors. In response, she proclaims:

> but what is my forgiveness? I like it. It is an act of self-healing, self-liberation, self-empowerment. All victims, all hurt, feel hopeless, feel helpless, feel powerless. I want everybody to remember that we cannot change what happened. That is the tragic part. But we can change how we relate to it. (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017).

Eva's story illustrates that the relationship between Jews and the Holocaust is malleable. I argue that the cookbooks analyzed here are similarly capable of changing the narrative of Jewish history and cultural identity. Eva's last three sentences offer the best summary of this project: "We cannot change what happened. That is the tragic part. But we can change how we relate to it" (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017). This thesis has demonstrated that not all Holocaust memory needs to

be steeped in sorrow and loss to be a powerful way of remembering. Rather, hope can be found in even the darkest of memories. Survival can be celebrated and a culture can be remade.

In this final chapter, I will examine the broader implications of this study. I will begin with a summary, offering a way to understand how the recipes and narratives may be understood as a cohesive unit. Next, I will take a broader view, explaining why these cookbooks are so important in the context of Holocaust memory for fourth generation Jews. Finally, I will offer some implications and potential directions for future research.

Summary

This thesis began with the declaration that "food is important." Chapter One explored this, offering an explanation of the relationship between food, memory, and culture. I established that food and memory were particularly intertwined for Jewish families and identity, but I also located a gap in the academic literature on the relationship between food, memory, and the Holocaust. Further, I introduced *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered*, the only three extant Holocaust cookbooks. Interested in this blending of Holocaust narrative and Jewish recipes, I set out to understand how these cookbooks might further develop both Holocaust memory and also Jewish identity for fourth generation American Jews.

In Chapter Two, I explained how these cookbooks are a unique instance of Holocaust remembrance. The Holocaust occupies a tenuous space in Jewish history. It is both a defining event, so different in scale and brutality that it must stand apart from the rest of Jewish history, and also just the latest and worst tragedy in a long line of Jewish tragedy. For both of these framings of the Holocaust, remembrance is centered on loss – a loss that is either so deep and grand that it is irreparable or just more loss added to a never-ending and overwhelming history of

loss. This is seen in the piles of shoes or lists of names present at most Holocaust museums and memorials and in the way Yom HaShoah has become a sacred day of sadness in Israel and around the world, on par with Tisha B'Av. *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* are different. As demonstrated in Chapter Two, the narratives both within and of these cookbooks are about optimism and survival through the Holocaust. These cookbooks offer a way to remember the Holocaust that does not treat the tragedy as irreparable. In these cookbooks, the loss of the Holocaust is remembered, but so too is the survival through it. The cookbooks offer a way to remember and celebrate Jewish survival, to take pride in being Jewish.

However, I also argued that memoirs or narratives alone cannot reinvigorate Jewish identity or Holocaust memory, since they are focused on loss and their words remain stuck on a page. Wieviorka argues that "these memorial books . . . have not been transmitted," meaning Jewish culture, religion, society, and life before the Holocaust cannot be transmitted through narratives or memoirs alone. Thus, to reinvigorate Jewish identity and Holocaust memory for fourth generation American Jews, something else is needed.

In Chapter Three, I explored that "something else," analyzing the recipes in these cookbooks within the context of Jewish food culture and characteristics of fourth generation American Jews. By offering a detailed description of the relationship between food, Judaism, and Jews, I explained why the recipes in these cookbooks are so important. It is the recipes – and the call for readers to actually utilize the recipes – that can reestablish Jewish food culture. The cookbooks not only transmit cultural information across generations but also literally re-create it. Finally, *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* are uniquely able to reinvigorate identity for fourth generation American Jews. Fourth generation

Jews are more likely to be secular, identify as culturally Jewish, and view remembering the Holocaust as the defining feature of being Jewish (Pew Research Center, 2013).

These cookbooks act as constitutive rhetoric for fourth generation American Jews, calling their Jewish identities into being. Though other memory texts may also act constitutively, these particular cookbooks call into being a different sort of Jewish identity, one that is not just about loss. The cookbooks instead focus on food, on recreating important parts of Jewish culture. Though this food is intertwined with Holocaust memory, it is a positive memory, framed through survival and pride in that survival. Thus, the Holocaust cookbooks functionally reframe Holocaust memory – offering a more optimistic and positive view of the Holocaust as not irreparable. The cookbooks recognize that "we cannot change what happened . . . But we can change how we relate to it" (BuzzfeedVideo, 2017).

In Chapter One, I asked what might be learned about how to further develop both Holocaust memory and Jewish identity for fourth generation Jewish Americans. Furthermore, I asked how these cookbooks use recipes and narratives together to reinvigorate Holocaust memory and Jewish identity. In Chapters Two and Three, I explained how these cookbooks can create a new, more optimistic way to remember the Holocaust that might be ideal for fourth generation American Jews. In the next two sections, I will explain why this matters, looking at the benefits of this study and potential implications.

Significance

Erica Brown (2000), in an article detailing current trends in Holocaust memorialization, argues that the core functions of Holocaust remembrance are to "remember" and "never forget" (Brown, p. 109). Wieviorka argues that part of never forgetting is the transmission of cultural information to the generations after the Holocaust. The call is not just to never forget the

Holocaust but also the lives of the first generation before the Holocaust forever changed their lives. The current forms of Holocaust memory have failed to meet these functions.

Brown notes the inherent problems within each form of Holocaust remembrance. Narratives – whether in interviews or survivor accounts or, more recently, more literary, fictional, and aesthetic forms – often lack the "chronology that we have come to expect of history" (Brown, 2000, p. 109). Instead, these narratives are often fragmentary, ambiguous, and difficult to authenticate. And, most of these narratives recount only the most terrible personal horrors. As discussed in Chapter Two, they are steeped in the lachrymose, either charting their own calamities "with others on the time-line of Jewish history" or depicting the Holocaust as "the central act of suffering of the Jewish people, incomparable to any other, a signal of the impending doom of Jewish nationhood" (Brown, 2000, p. 109).

Brown points out the problems of creating physical monuments, memorials, and museums as well. She argues that Holocaust memory has become "museumized." By sealing away artifacts behind glass, creating routinized, official ways of remembering, and creating institutionalized narratives about the Holocaust, Holocaust memory becomes "bounded, determinate" (Brown, 2000, p. 110). Edward Linenthal, in his book documenting the creation of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, offers more specific problems with creating museums and memorials to the Holocaust:

> What level of horror could be appropriately portrayed through photograph and artifact, how perpetrators could be portrayed without glorification, how various victim groups could be represented appropriately, and how to end without enshrining either despair or redemption. (Linenthal, 1995, p. 3-4)

Taken together, current forms of Holocaust memory have two problems then. First, narrative accounts of the Holocaust are deeply melancholic. And while Holocaust memory should, undoubtedly, have a sense of sadness and loss, *only* remembering the Holocaust through sadness and loss creates problems for Jewish history, culture, and identity, especially for fourth generation American Jews. I started going to Hebrew school when I was about five years old and did not stop attending until my sophomore year of high school. Once in college, I began taking classes in Holocaust studies. Imagine learning about the Holocaust only through sadness and loss for most of one's life. Imagine one's identity being tied to one of the darkest events in all of human history. Being Jewish quickly becomes something not to be proud of, but scared and ashamed of. Being Jewish becomes remembering that being Jewish is what killed most of one's ancestors and nothing else. Being Jewish gets reduced to a state of victimization.

Recall that 73% of Jews define being Jewish as "remembering the Holocaust" (Pew Research Center, 2013). It is remembering the Holocaust that has "created a sense of Jewish community at a time of assimilation" (Brown, 2000, p. 120). The Holocaust has, quite literally, become the cement holding the Jewish community together. And, when that memory is not only all about misery, trauma, and loss but also set apart as a unique calamity that is irreparable, current Holocaust memory can never "provide a positive Jewish identity, whether one that is secular or religious" (Brown, 2000, p. 123).

Second, the bounded-ness and routinization of current Holocaust memory, though an attempt to create a coherent, collective form of Holocaust memory, has functionally sealed away memory. The work is already done, eliminating the need for individuals to remember on their own terms. As James E. Young puts it,

> Instead of inciting memory of murdered Jews, we suspected, it would be a place where Germans would come dutifully to unshoulder their memorial burden, so that they could move freely and unencumbered into the twenty-first century. A finished monument would, in effect, finish memory itself. (Young, 2002, p. 70)

Though Young is speaking specifically of the decision to create a national Holocaust monument in Berlin, the same general concept applies – creating so many museums, memorials, and monuments for the Holocaust takes the burden of memory away from individuals. Moreover, I argue this is not just a problem with actual sites of Holocaust memory but of routines too. Yom HaShoah and other national and international Holocaust remembrance days (such as International Holocaust Remembrance Day, which is on the anniversary of the liberation of Auschwitz every year, or the eleven more local remembrance days in Europe that commemorate various uprisings or camp liberations) have similarly sealed off memory work.

In Memory's Kitchen, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook*, and *Recipes Remembered* are different. They offer a rare form of Holocaust memory that is not preoccupied with loss. Instead, they re-frame Holocaust memory in a more optimistic light, focusing on survival through and beyond the Holocaust. They change the way fourth generation Jews relate to the Holocaust – instead of being an event fundamentally about horror, sadness, and terror, it is about pride in surviving through such an event. Further, by offering recipes that can be followed or used as a foundation for new recipes, they offer a way to bring the past into the present, to reestablish Jewish food culture in a world beyond the Holocaust. In this sense, these cookbooks can transmit cultural information across generations in a way that narratives (and memorials/museums) are unable to do. Instead of sealing off memory, they ask each individual reader to do memory work by cooking the recipes of survivors. Being Jewish is no longer about the loss of the Holocaust,

but about the creation and sharing of important parts of culture, like food and recipes. This is particularly important for fourth generation Jews. In the last section, I will speak to this importance.

A New Memory for a New Generation

Several scholars have recently begun to grapple with how Holocaust memory is and will change (examples include: Rotem 2013, Hansen-Glucklic 2014, and Eder, Gassert and Steinweis 2016). Within the next decade, a fourth wave of Holocaust memory will begin; for the first time, all Holocaust survivors will have died of natural causes. Thus, all memory will become mediated. Instead of a class visit to see a Holocaust survivor speak, children will take fieldtrips to museums that have hologram Holocaust survivors. This is not science fiction. Within the past few weeks, the Illinois Holocaust Museum and Education Center in Skokie, Illinois has opened an exhibit that features Holocaust survivors speaking as holograms. The $5 million Take A Stand Center, where the holograms are located, was built precisely for this purpose: the CEO of the museum, Susan Abrams, explains "It prepares us for the day when our survivors will not be here . . . Right now, the 60,000 students and educators who come through plus tens of thousands of general visitors have the incredible privilege to hear directly from a survivor" (Isaacs, 2017, para. 11).

This demands that scholars and memorial/museum-makers re-think how they create Holocaust memory. And while several scholars have begun to think about how Holocaust memory might change "in a globalized world" or evaluate newer trends in Holocaust memorialization (such as the focus on "being an upstander"), scholars have yet to consider how Holocaust memory changes when the people doing remembering change. Scholars need to re-evaluate and analyze Holocaust memory sites and practices within the context of fourth

generation Jews. Fourth generation Jews already think of being Jewish as primarily about Holocaust remembrance and have few ties to Judaism beyond that. Thus, Holocaust memory needs to become more dynamic and interactive. Holocaust memory needs to find ways to pull fourth generation Jews back into Judaism, centering their Jewish identities on something other than the loss and tragedy of the Holocaust. Otherwise, as future generations become more and more removed from the Holocaust, all ability to transmit cultural (and religious) information will be lost. When the majority of Jews see the defining feature of Judaism as remembering the Holocaust, then Judaism itself will be forgotten.

This has two broad implications for future research. First, scholars should reconsider current and past Holocaust memory in relationship to fourth generation Jews who already consider Holocaust remembrance to be of utmost importance. Second, Holocaust memory should embrace this optimistic framing of survival through the Holocaust. To be clear, I am not arguing that Holocaust memory should *only* be optimistic. Remembering the tremendous loss of the Holocaust is still enormously important. However, for fourth generation American Jews, remembering the Holocaust should not *only* be about remembering loss. When fourth generation Jews can relate to the Holocaust with optimism, what and who survived is remembered and embraced. By doing this, memory sites, practices, and texts can focus on ensuring that it is not just the Holocaust that is remembered, but also survival of the culture and life that existed prior to the Holocaust. By focusing on survival through and beyond the Holocaust, Judaism becomes not just about remembering the Holocaust, but also the practices that make up Judaism and Jewish culture.

Holocaust memory is undoubtedly changing. As it changes, however, it is vital that fourth generation Jews are not lost. Though the loss of the Holocaust and those that were lost in the

Holocaust must never be forgotten, the life they lived before the Holocaust must also not be forgotten. *In Memory's Kitchen*, the *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook* and *Recipes Remembered* are able to do precisely this. By offering narratives alongside recipes, they ensure that those that survived are not forgotten. Their stories are remembered both in print and in memory when they are read aloud. And, by offering recipes alongside narratives, these cookbooks ensure that Holocaust memory is not just about loss, but also survival of Jews and Jewish culture into the future. They ensure that the past is brought into the present. By offering usable recipes and asking that survivors' stories be read aloud when making and sharing these recipes, by changing the way Jews relate to the Holocaust, these cookbooks reconstruct Jewish life for fourth generation American Jews in a world beyond the Holocaust.

References

A Portrait of Jewish Americans. (2013, September 30). Pew Research Center: Religion & Public Life. Retrieved from http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey/

Brown, E. (2000). "Turning All the Past to Pain": Current Trends in the Memorialization of the Holocaust. *The Torah U-Madda Journal*, *9*, 108-132. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/40914644

BuzzfeedVideo. (2017, September 15). *I Survived the Holocaust Twin Experiments*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gdgPAetNY5U

Caras, J. (2007). *Holocaust Survivor Cookbook: Collected from around the World*. Port St. Lucie, FL: Caras & Associates. Print.

De Silva, C, ed. (1996). *In Memory's Kitchen: A Legacy from the Women of Terezin*. Northvale, NJ: J. Aronson. Print.

Eder, J. S., Gassert, P., & Steinweis, A. E. (2016). *Holocaust Memory in a Globalizing World*. Göttingen, Niedersachs: Wallstein

Hansen-Glucklich, J. (2014). *Holocaust memory reframed: museums and the challenges of representation*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers Univ. Press

Hersh, J.F. (2011). *Recipes Remembered: A Celebration of Survival*. New York, NY: Museum of Jewish Heritage. Print.

Isaacs, M. (2017, November 02). Hologram technology in Holocaust Museum exhibit immortalizes survivors' stories. *The Chicago Tribune*. Retrieved from http://www.chicagotribune.com/suburbs/skokie/news/ct-skr-holocaust-museum-take-a-stand-tl-1102-20171101-story.html

Linenthal, E. (1995). *Preserving Memory: The Struggle over the Creation of America's Holocaust Museum*. New York, NY: Viking Adult.

Rotem, S. S. (2013). A Sense of Jewish Empowerment or a Lesson in Universal Values? New Directions in the Design of Holocaust Museums in the USA. *Dapim: Studies on the Holocaust*, *27*(2), 129-153. doi:10.1080/23256249.2013.825470

Wieviorka, A. (2006). *The Era of the Witness*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. Print.

Young, J. E. (2002). Germany's Holocaust Memorial Problem—and Mine. *The Public Historian*, 24(4), 65-80.